



BOOK REVIEWS

REVIEWERS

The Very Revd Professor JA Whyte (*St Andrews*), The Revd Charles Robertson, Canongate Kirk, Edinburgh, The Revd T Graeme Longmuir, Editor, "*The Record*", The Revd A Stewart Todd (*St Machar's Cathedral, Aberdeen*)

* * * * *

Studies in the History of Worship in Scotland. edd. D Forrester and D. Murray Second Edition, 1996. pb T & T Clark. 208pp £12.50

Contributors

Chapter 1	<i>The Beginnings</i>	Ian Muirhead
Chapter 2	<i>The Middle Ages</i>	James Galbraith
Chapter 3	<i>Reformation to Covenant</i>	Gordon Donaldson
Chapter 4	<i>Covenant to Revolution</i>	Gordon Donaldson
Chapter 5	<i>Revolution to Disruption</i>	Henry Sefton
Chapter 6	<i>Disruption to Union</i>	Douglas Murray
Chapter 7	<i>Episcopal Worship in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries</i>	Allan Maclean
Chapter 8	<i>Roman Catholic Worship</i>	Mark Dilworth
Chapter 9	<i>The Scottish Tradition of Preaching</i>	David Read
Chapter 10	<i>The Setting of Worship</i>	James Whyte
Chapter 11	<i>Worship since 1929</i>	Duncan Forrester

The appearance of a second edition of this book provides an opportunity to commend it to the attention of members of this Society and other readers of the Society's *Record*, in particular to any who for one reason or another may have overlooked its merits when it first appeared in 1984 and to those whose interest in this subject is of more recent date. In the Introduction to the first edition the editors expressed the hope that the book would stimulate research and writing in this neglected area of study and this is repeated in the brief Introduction to the second edition. Whether this aim



has been achieved perhaps those closest to our post-graduate schools are best able to judge but that the book offers an admirably clear and informative guide to the history of worship in Scotland is a judgement that this reviewer makes without hesitation. The book should be compulsory reading for students, a recommended purchase for all ministers and the subject of an advertisement in all Church publications as a godsend for general readers who want to familiarise themselves quickly with the broad outline of the subject and who have been deterred hitherto by arcane tomes on worship in general and precious little on worship in Scotland in particular.

Judgements are made by reviewers: judgements are also made by historians. In one of his books (1) Charles Thomas sets the following words of Douglas Simpson at the head of a chapter on *St Ninian and Christianity in Scotland*: "In an enquiry that deals with names so remote and materials so diverse and obscure, there is abundant room for conflict of judgement". The writer of Chapter One *The Beginnings* treads carefully, prepared certainly to posit beginnings of Christianity in Scotland before the date 397, which is the subject of commemoration in this quaintly designated "Year of Faith", (to be followed by equally quaintly designated years of hope and love) but not entering the controversy about the extent of possible missionary endeavour in Ninian's time. Though he does not say so, the reason for assuming Christianity north of Hadrian's wall predating 397 is that Ninian comes to Whithorn as a bishop and therefore to a community of Christians. Edward Thompson (2) writes: "No example is known of a man who was appointed bishop with the specific task of going beyond the frontier in order to convert the



barbarians. A bishop with no Christian communities subject to his authority was an unknown phenomenon beyond the Imperial frontier". The point is made however that if the association with St Martin of Tours can be established then one may reasonably assume that Martin's new concepts of monasticism and new standards of Episcopal care were applied by Ninian, care which included evangelisation of the countryside. The pattern is continued by Columba.

One of the most notable features in this first chapter is, however, the vigour with which the writer scotches the myth of the "Celtic Church" and in particular the popular misconceptions of the agenda at the Synod of Whitby (664). He writes: "Though the debate has often been represented as one between the Roman and the Celtic Church, the contestants would hardly have recognised themselves under such descriptions, since neither then nor at any other time was there a Celtic Church". The controversy, it is explained, was about Church structure, monastic/episcopal. The so-called Celtic Church might exhibit the marks of Celtic culture but in creed and origin, and initially in organisation and practice, it was thoroughly Roman. Local variations of the liturgy there were, as also in Gaul, Spain and other parts of the Christian world, but a separatist Celtic Church was an invention of eighteenth-century Scottish historians to serve their own polemical interest.

Descriptions of worship in this early period are given. Gallican influences in the Book of Deer are noted, as is also the Gallican practice of beginning the lessons with the Gospel. The chapter includes references to artefacts from the period but ends with a restatement of the earlier contention:



oddities and survivals must not blind the student to the fact that, superficial differences apart, the underlying worship-patterns of the period are those which develop into the medieval forms of worship of the next period.

The chapter on *The Middle Ages* discusses the "uses" that were followed in Scotland, The Use of Sarum (Salisbury), uses peculiar to regular clergy such as Franciscan and Dominican friars and Cistercian monks, the uses of York and of Trondheim. Continental influences on worship and ceremonial are noted but so also is a growing nationalism among the Scottish clergy, a nationalism for the most part positive and constructive, leading to such things as the foundation of collegiate churches, Scotland's first three universities and a revival of interest in the national saints. This brings the writer (by way of the Breviary associated with collegiate church of Fowlis Easter, the Arbuthnott Missal of 1491 and a Missal of 1506 adapted for the use of St Nicholas Church, Aberdeen) to the notable contribution of Bishop William Elphinstone and the canons of his Cathedral of St Machar, the Aberdeen Breviary of 1510.

The author then uses his study of Elphinstone's work, its intention and its contracts, to paint the picture of worship in Scotland in the period. Since it seems undeniable that Elphinstone had at his disposal material collected from a number of dioceses, including his own, his is a useful course to pursue. The Aberdeen Breviary however, though unique in the Middle Ages as a national use and though liturgically a considerable accomplishment, was not successful. More thorough reform of the Western Church was required.



Elphinstone's Aberdeen Breviary being the source book and subject matter for so much of this chapter, it is regrettable that in this second edition Dr Leslie Macfarlane's *magnum opus* on Elphinstone (3), published in 1985, has not been added to the bibliography.

There follow two chapters bearing the titles *Reformation to Covenant* and *Covenant to Revolution*. These chapters represent a compacting of massive scholarly research, much of it previously published (4). The material presented in this way, especially that pertaining to worship of the Reformation period, does not merely challenge or disturb myths about the period but blows them apart. In particular *The Book of Common Order* or "Knox's Liturgy" emerges from these pages in its true catholicity, its debt to Geneva of course being recognised but also its kinship in language and thought-patterns with the English *Book of Common Prayer*. More importantly it is seen to stand fairly and squarely within the centuries-long tradition of the Church's worship: all the familiar features of traditional liturgy are there, including Lord's Prayer (in the Prayer Book version), Creed, Doxology at the end of psalms, a regular ordering of lessons, Canticles and kneeling as the posture for prayer. Congregational participation was provided primarily through the singing of psalms (5). Above all, as the writer plainly states, the structure of Morning Service was shaped by attitudes to the Lord's Supper.

The story of the reformers' ideal and their failure to achieve it is familiar. Holy Communion as the service for every Lord's Day was a star they could not touch: they chose it however as their guide. Worship for Sunday morning (if there was no Communion) was devised with the ancient



Eucharist pattern in mind. Ante-Communion is the word the writer uses to describe the service, but while this term is not inaccurate it is not appropriate. The particle ante is an almost featureless prefix. Set before Communion it suggests all too readily the disproportionate importance that had been given for too long to the sacramental part of Sunday worship, and it certainly is inadequate to reflect the reformers' strong emphasis on the equal importance of Word and Sacrament and their eagerness to instruct the people. Synaxis of Service of the Word would be a happier appellation. In faithfulness to this model, Morning Service in *The Book of Common Order* or Knox's Liturgy had after sermon a long prayer of intercession, Lord's Prayer, Creed, psalm and blessing. When Holy Communion was celebrated this led on to warrant and invitation.

The chapter is equally helpful in illustrating the centrality of the congregation in reformed thinking about worship - in physical arrangements for the celebration of Holy Communion, in baptism and in discipline.

The ideal mentioned above has of course been shared by many in this Society and the model for the Service of the Word which the reformers handed down was to be a source of inspiration to founders and early members of the Society in the nineteenth century, as well as the subject of controversy among them, as is related in Chapter Six. The same thought-patterns were shared by members of the Society who participated in preparation of the 1979 *Book of Common Order* and by some at least of those who were responsible for *Common Order*.



Chapter Five, *Revolution to Disruption* will be for many readers something of a revelation. The author acknowledges that "the worship of eighteenth-century Scotland has been little esteemed" and while he does not claim that there were great advances in the form and order of public worship in that century, he nevertheless makes it plain that questions relating to worship exercised the minds of many clergy. It was controversy concerning worship which led to the Act of 1712, commonly called the Toleration Act, an Act which effectively recognised two Churches in Scotland and gave legal sanction to worship other than that of the Established Church, though only those Episcopal ministers were "tolerated" who were willing to take the oath of allegiance to Queen Anne and the oath of abjuration of the exiled Stuarts. This encouraged liturgical activity in the Episcopal Church and in particular led to the work of Bishop Thomas Rattray, which was influential not only in Scotland but also conspicuously in the United States.

The chapter brings to the readers' attention the writings of John Willison and the remarkable liturgical practices of the Glasites, which included a weekly celebration of the Lord's Supper and an agape meal. More than that the chapter illuminates the period with a selection of quotations from Kirk Session records and other documents. Tiresome as features such as the "lecturing" which almost completely superseded the reading of Scripture must have been, there is ample evidence of the desire to increase the frequency of celebration of the Lord's Supper, to encourage the administration of baptism at public worship and to improve psalmody. Fixed seating was introduced in churches and by the end of the period



elders were distributing the bread and wine to the people in their pews, the desks being covered with white cloths. The Society will take pride in this well-researched piece of work by one of its Honorary Presidents.

The Society will be equally grateful to the contributor of the next chapter, *Disruption to Union* for in this chapter the history of our Society is provided in a compendious but scholarly manner. Tacitus claimed that posterity gives every man his true value and even if that claim is probably too sanguine to go unchallenged in our debunking age, posterity will hardly grudge recognition to the founders of this Society and their associates for the enormous contribution they made to the enhancement of worship in Scotland in the second half of the nineteenth century. The author places their concern and their achievement in their social, historical and theological context. This interest in liturgy was not antiquarian. The worship-forms of the period immediately after the Reformation were valued not merely because they were in accord with ancient Christian usage but because they were based on sound reformed theology.

The chapter recalls the great names of the period, Sprott, Leishman, Lee, Macleod, Story, Cameron Lees, Campbell, Milligan, Wotherspoon, Cooper; describes the controversies surrounding them; traces the pedigree of *Euchologion* and analyses the disagreements within the Society. In particular the disagreement over the order for Morning Service in the sixth edition of *Euchologion* is described. The order in the first five editions, following early Scottish reformed tradition, was based on the Eucharist pattern, with prayers of thanksgiving and intercession and the Lord's Prayer after sermon. The decision in 1888 to place the Lord's Prayer at the



end of the first prayer and the prayers of thanksgiving and intercession before the sermon was regretted by the high churchmen in the Society, as the author calls them. They regretted the assimilation of Morning Service to Anglican Matins, and the departure from reformed Scottish tradition, ancient practice and sound theology. It is worth noting the facts here because very often the high churchmen have been accused of aping Anglicanism. In this important regard it is manifestly untrue! The disagreement led to the formation of the Scottish Church Society.

Euchologion prepared the way for official publications, ultimately for the 1928 *Book of Common Order* and for the formation within the united Church of a standing committee of the Assembly, the Committee on Public Worship and Aids to Devotion.

The chapter deals also with hymnals, organs, observance of the Christian year, changes in the conduct of marriages and funerals and in the celebration of Holy Communion. The chapter is invaluable.

One must ask whether the arrangements of the book from this point on is wholly satisfactory. Chapter Eleven, Worship since 1929, separated from *Disruption to Union* by seventy-odd pages is strangely detached. It would have been preferable to have it follow Chapter Six. The whole book could then have concluded with an epilogue or the like. Chapter Eleven does in fact carry the story through to the present day in a perceptive and engaging manner, mentioning publications that are familiar and which have been commented upon in recent years in this *Record*.



Chapter Seven is a detailed history of worship in the Episcopal Church in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries and Chapter Eight purports to be a history of post-Reformation Roman Catholic worship in Scotland. In fact and in the nature of the case it is, as the author acknowledges, really a history of that Church and a remarkable story it is, tracing the Church's fortunes from the 1560's, when Mass was forbidden and celebrated clandestinely in only a few places, through to tremendous nineteenth-century expansion and to the 1960's when, as is stated, Roman Catholics represented 15.7% of the population of Scotland. It would have been interesting to learn more of the effects of Vatican II on worship in the Roman Catholic Church in this land but the post-Reformation story, even in its less honourable parts, is told with candour, yet with no hint of bitterness.

The remaining two chapters are entitled *The Scottish Tradition of Preaching* and *The Setting of Worship*. The first is not so much an historical study as an essay on important features of the preaching tradition in Scotland. The second is a useful complement to the central chapters of the book. It is stimulating, not least in challenging the helpfulness of some of the innovations in worship and practice advocated by the Society over the years.

Too much zeal in matters relating to worship can be dangerous and liturgical fundamentalism is intolerable. These excesses have never troubled the Church of Scotland to any great extent but, as this whole book shows, the common perception of insouciance on the matter as a



characteristic of the Church of Scotland is unfair and certainly as a feature of the reformed tradition is a myth.

A.S.T.

- (1) C Thomas *Christianity in Roman Britain to AD500* Batsford 1981
- (2) E A Thompson *The Origins of Christianity in Scotland, Scot. Hist. Rev.* 37, 17-22
- (3) L J Macfarlane *William Elphinstone and the Kingdom of Scotland 1431-1514* A.V.P. 1985
- (4) Gordon Donaldson *The Making of the Scottish Prayer Book of 1637* Edinburgh 1954
- Gordon Donaldson *The Scottish Reformation* Cambridge 1960
- Gordon Donaldson Ed. 'A Scottish Liturgy of the Reign of James VI', *Scottish History Society Miscellany 10* (1965), 87-117
- Gordon Donaldson 'Scottish Ordinations in the Restoration Period', *Scot. Hist. Rev.* 33, 169-175.

- (5) The Tune, often in the tenor part, was designated in the Psalter *Church part*.

* * * * *

Supplementary Versions of the Scottish Metrical Psalms Music Edition The Psalmody Committee of The Free Church of Scotland 1994 56 pp. No price given

The Psalms The Liturgical Psalter New Inclusive Language Version HarperCollins 1995 270 pp. £7.99

Psalms for Christian Prayer Bede Griffiths ed. by Roland R Ropers HarperCollins 1995 164 pp. £9.99

The Psalter is a corner-stone of both Jewish and Christian devotion, and these three publications bear witness to the importance of the psalms for use both in private prayer and in public worship.

1. The Free Church booklet represents the second stage in their Psalmody's Committee's efforts "to foster the Reformed tradition of metrical Psalm singing by issuing versions in the modern idiom." Twenty-



four Psalms, or portions of Psalms (Psalm 1 appears in two versions, thus making the total twenty-five), have been re-worked, nine in long metre, six in common meter, four in short metre, one in double short metre, three in 8 8 8 8 8 8, one in 10 10 10 10, and one in 11 11 11 11. While the new material is welcome, it does not always overcome the awkwardnesses of the versification of the traditional version: a look at Psalm 1 (A), for instance, reveals some of the same infelicities (such as cumbersome inversions and pseudo-rhymes) which are natural to the mid-seventeenth century *Scottish Psalter* but which are not normal, or desirable, today. But that having been said, this attempt to provide fresh metrical versions of the Psalms is a brave and commendable one.

The tunes to which these psalm portions are set make the booklet very fresh indeed. The old familiar tunes such as, *Chilton Foliat*, *Church Triumphant*, *Diademata*, *Llef*, *St Denio (Joanna)*, *St Ethelwald*, and *Surrey*, seem to take on a new life when sung to psalms. Newer tunes, such as *Billing*, *Birling* and *West Burn* give the booklet an air of energy and vigour which is appealing and compelling. And tunes such as *Bay of Harris*, appearing for the first time in a collection, are melodies which deserves widespread use. The Committee is to be congratulated on demonstrating by this modest collection that small can be beautiful.

2. **The Liturgical Psalter** is a revision of the book of that name (prepared by the Church of England Liturgical Commission in 1976) undertaken at the request of the Liturgical Commission of the Anglican Church of Australia, and is "designed to meet the need of those Christians concerned to use inclusive language." The original book was a fresh



translation of the Hebrew, presented in a style and rhythm, suitable for singing or reading aloud in church, and intended for use in private prayer and study in addition to public worship. The new version retains faithfulness to the Hebrew as its prime objective, and even makes some changes to reflect fresh development in Hebrew scholarship; it also succeeds in using English that is both decorous and lively. The inclusive element is not obtrusive, emerging only in the occasional phrase ("children of earth" for "children (sons) of men": Pss. 4:2, 49:2, 62:9) and in the slight monotony occasioned by representing distributive singulars -
Blessed is the man" - by plurals.

The book is pleasing to the eye, is well laid out for liturgical purposes, and is a delight to use. To read Psalm 18 antiphonally, for instance, is an exhilarating experience, the layout, the language, and the literary force all combining to provide a vehicle for liturgical enrichment and spiritual sustenance.

3. **Psalms for Christian Prayer** is a sort of sheep in sheep's clothing. It is the Psalter anaesthetised. In a fascinating Introduction, Bede Griffiths (A Benedictine monk who discovered "the other half of his soul" in India where he settled in a Christian community in Shantivanam) tells us why he has edited the psalms so that all reference to 'enemies' or against God has been expurgated, and every expression of anger, hatred, and revenge against one's 'enemies' or against God has been expunged. He argues that this needs to be done in the interests of Christian prayer, in which such sentiments are unacceptable, and in which should appear only such aspects of spiritual experience as thanking God for all the work of



creation and for his providence over human life, asking him for mercy and forgiveness, and looking forward to the joy of reconciliation and union with God.

But are there not moments when we need to find words to rail against God? Are there not circumstances that drive us in Christian sympathy to stand alongside our sisters and brothers in their distress? Are there not times when we *must* shout against the pain and injustice in the world? To hold back and keep silence would be to disable our Christianity and to diminish our solidarity with Christ and with all who suffer. We *need* a full Psalter for the full-orbed expression of Christian experience. This book, though well-produced, is ill-conceived, promotionⁱⁿ as it does both a bowdlerised Psalter and an anaemic Christianity.

C R

* * * * *

The Music of Silence (Entering the sacred space of monastic experience)
David Steindl-Rast, O.S.B., with Sharon Lebell, Harper San Fransisco
(Harper Collins/Publishers) 1995 pb 122 pp with CD The Benedictine
Monks of Santo Dominto de Silos.

The contents are divided into 9 sections, corresponding to the Monastic Offices:

Vigils:	The Night Watch
Lauds:	The Coming of the Light
Prime:	Deliberate Beginning
Terce:	Blessing
Sext:	Fervour and Commitment
None:	Shadows Grow Longer
Vespers:	Lighting the Lamps
Compline:	Completing the Circle
The Great Silence:	The Marking of Time

with two introductory sections



- 1) A Note of Gregorian Chant;
- 2) The Seasons of the Day

Gregorian Chant is a vast collection of music, made up of three thousand chants. It grew over many centuries and is widely believed to be derived from Jewish chant, since its earliest forms can be traced to Palestine and Syria.

The oldest mss containing chant melodies date from the 10th Century. It was in the early Middle Ages that Gregorian chant, which was flourishing within the Holy Roman Empire, assumed what is today considered its traditional form (though later musical innovations developed). In the 19th Century, amid much controversy over what Gregorian chant should really be, the Benedictine monks at the Abbey of Solesmes, in France, embarked on a century-long effort to restore the chant to its medieval traditional form with which we (and the watchers of "Top of the Pops") are familiar.

In our tradition we are unfamiliar with both chant and silence, to our loss. This little gem of a book is worthy of a place in every minister's study and the CD should be played frequently and often.

Our frenetic lives, as we dart anxiously from one activity to the next, should lead us all to realise that there is more to life than our worldly agendas.

Chant music evokes a different relationship time, one in which time, while precious, isn't scarce.



Our "wordy" form of religion amplifies the "noise" of our existence, but this book emphasises the sacred, transcendental quality of the melodic lines that many find so appealing about Gregorian chant.

Almost every sentence in this book is loaded with "Sermon Material"; and counsel is cautioned, for this book, and its accompanying CD should be an integral part of every minister's private spiritual exercises.

For example, in the section "Sext" great emphasis is placed on the ringing of the Angelus Bell. They were really instituted in the first place to announce a prayer for peace. Wherever people were, in the fields or at their work, in their shops or at home, when they heard the Angelus bell, they would stop work to pray. That was also true with the morning bells and with the evening bells. As a frequent visitor to Austria, I am well accustomed to being woken by the bells at 6.00 and 7.00 am and alerted to the weekday Celebration of the Mass at 19.00hrs when the bells ring out.

As one who rings his Chapel Bell at 7.00 am on weekday mornings before the Celebration of the Eucharist, and who hears his Bell tolling at 8.30am for the Daily Service and receives the echo from across the Valley, there is much to be said for the Anglican tradition of the newly-instituted incumbent tolling the Bell to signify his acceptance of his office and informing the parish that he has done so. That is a symbolic act more telling to the "outside world" than our signing of the Formula.

This little book should be on the desk, (? next to the 'phone) and readily available for reading.



To all colleagues who feel themselves isolated, solitary and alone - this little gem should and could give structure to our disordered lives.

TGL

* * * * *

L'architecture religieuse des protestants, Bernard Reymond, Geneva, Labor et Fides, pp.296

This masterly book by the Professor of Practical Theology in Lausanne is intended to fill a gap in the literature. He fills it with scholarship, wisdom and wit. It is remarkably comprehensive. As well as looking with fresh eyes at fundamental questions of the relation between religion and architecture, and of Protestantism in particular, at the idea of holy places, at space as "the forgotten dimension", at style (a modern problem), he deals practically with the organisation of worship space, and with matters such as shade, light and colour, symbols and decoration, acoustics, and even smells. He deals with the vexed problem of restoration (which Ruskin called the worst form of destruction a building can suffer) and looks for signs of the model of architectural presence that is appropriate today.

The limitation of the book, which I hope will not impede its translation and publication into English, is that it is concerned chiefly with francophone Protestantism, in Switzerland and France. Nevertheless, the range of his knowledge is impressive, and he draws examples from Scotland (e.g.



Burntisland) and from the United States. The great virtue of the book, which makes it a fine example of critical practical theology, is that he never loses touch with the essential and abiding character of Reformed worship, nor forgets the changing cultural milieux in which it must be expressed and housed.

We have been entertained recently to a little debate between Lord Runcie and Bishop Richard Holloway. Lord Runcie dislikes "clappy-and-happy" services and believes that they are dangerous. Bishop Holloway believes they are attracting young people who wouldn't otherwise come in. I share Robert Runcie's dislike of clappy-happy services. They certainly empty me out of church double-quick, though I would not be attracted either by the Anglo-catholic worship which he favours. If it were simply a matter of which type of worship fills churches and which empties them, we should engage a sociologist to find the answer.

But the debate is about more than that. Lord Runcie believes that the essence of worship is at risk here. Such services "reduce God to a puppet. If you alter services just to get people into church, that's very dangerous." Bishop Holloway believes that "we need a broad range of worship styles that will be appropriate to the different settings in which the church finds itself."

Robert Runcie no doubt has in mind the 9-o'clock service in Sheffield, which was encouraged and supported by the church authorities because it was outwardly successful in bringing people into church. Later it proved to be a destructive ego-trip, which damaged many lives. What is



outwardly successful does not always glorify God. Richard Holloway, on the other hand, does not think that the essence of worship is at risk in these services and he is aware that if we do not use the language and style of our culture we are as alien to it as the Latin of the Medieval Church.

I think that the problem of the church today, and not only, though perhaps especially, of the Anglican church, is that we have lost the theological criteria to judge what is essentially Christian worship and to see when a service has drifted away from its Christian moorings. The Anglicans were safe when they could rest on "our incomparable prayer-book" as they used to call it. That gone, they are at sea without bearings. But the situation of the Church of Scotland gives it little cause for self-satisfaction. Before the time of the Judges in ancient Israel, so we are told, "every man did what was right in his own eyes." So it is with us today, if for "man" you read "minister, male or female." We live in the age of the gimmick when anything that seems to work is embraced as a new saviour - even the mindless laughter of the Toronto blessing, "laughing at a joke that has never been made."

Bernard Reymond is never in doubt about the abiding essence of Reformed worship. It is to give glory to the God of grace, who through his Word of grace is in the midst of his believing people. The Reformers had to adapt pre-reformation buildings or build anew for a worship radically different from the pluralistic worship of the old church. They did this with considerable success, despite the problems of volume and acoustic in the larger pre-reformation churches. They purged the buildings of images and instruments of idolatry. They had no thought of the artistic value of these



things, any more than they thought about the "style" of the buildings themselves. Such value-judgments come later.

We think of style. The medieval builder had no thought of style. He moved from Norman to Gothic because this was a new technique which enabled him to build higher and lighter. The Renaissance produced interest in classical architecture, and classicism came to be used for public and religious buildings. By the time of the Reformation, the Roman church had largely abandoned Gothic. The influence of culture on religious architecture is seen also in the baroque - the church as theatre. Reformed churches in the baroque style tend to be more restrained than the Catholic examples, but in both we see the tendency for the building itself to influence the worship which it houses. In the United States we find the most graceful examples of neo-classical churches, which also serve to underline their independence of England.

The apotheosis of style however is in the Gothic revival or neo-medievalism, which Raymond compares to a tidal wave, engulfing everything. This is the architecture of nostalgia, looking back to a golden age of faith which never was and believing that if one could recreate the buildings of that age of faith, the faith itself would return. This type of romanticism informed the Anglo-catholic movement, and later, I believe, the Scoto-catholic movement. It led to the extraordinary dogmatism of the Cambridge Camden Society about what is or is not correct in churches, and it clearly influenced those who contributed to the Aberdeen, later Scottish Ecclesiological Society. It led to the flood of "restorations", which, in the name of the medieval myth, turned churches into what they



had never been before. There is not a Cathedral in England where the visitor is seeing a medieval church. What is seen is the church as recreated according to the vision of the Victorian restorers. The efforts of our own ecclesiologists are to be seen everywhere, in rural parish and in city church. They built on apses and they turned even T-shaped churches into long-axis, vista buildings, with the focus on a table at the east end. Reymond has a kind word to say about the new arrangement of St. Giles in Edinburgh. "... the architect Douglas Laird has conceived an arrangement in a square, with the table in full centre which respects perfectly the general balance of the building.... "

The main example of nostalgic religion today is possibly not neo-medievalism, though that is still with us, but conservative neo-Reformationism, which confuses modern fundamentalism (a reaction of fear against biblical criticism) and individualistic American revivalism with the faith and worship of the Reformers. That is not the way in which the essence of Reformed worship is to be expressed in our day. We need to be thankful, however, that this conservatism has not yet had any architectural consequences.

This, I realise, is less a review than an airing of the thoughts which Reymond has stimulated in one reader. We will look forward to further stimulus from him when he gives the Church Service Society lecture in October.

J A W