

THE MANNA OF ECCLESIOLOGY: contributions by members of the Church Service Society to the development of Scottish Ecclesiology from 1863

Thank-yous

My thanks are due to our President and to Council for inviting me to deliver this delayed Presidential Address and to share thoughts with you about a subject close to my heart. A complete list of thank-yous would include the names of all the people across Scotland and England, even Europe and Canada, who have shown me their churches and shared historic – or legendary – material. There are three that must be mentioned by name. First, my late Father, Nevill Davidson Kelly, an elder in the Kirk of the Greyfriars, Edinburgh, a Council member of this Society for many years and the last Secretary of the Scottish Ecclesiological Society. My schoolboy ecclesiological memories include people in our home; excursions to tower houses, church-extension churches and medieval Abbeys – ruined and restored; and postcards from holidays of my parents in England or Europe, chosen to interest the young mind in sacred space, splendid tombs of medieval warriors, beautiful furnishings, or educational and devotional tools like stained glass from Canterbury and Chartres. Former Presidents Henry Sefton and James Stewart have shared endlessly of their time, knowledge and advice. Each of them is a living embodiment of the Scottish tradition in ecclesiology: Christian churchmen, deeply involved in the life of the Church of their lifetime, yet aware of and sensitive to the riches historical and aesthetic of the places in which the worship of God is conducted. Finally, I wish to dedicate this talk to a true friend, a good churchman, a thoughtful trainer of candidates for the ministry of the Church and a fine student of ecclesiastical history: the late Dr Douglas Murray.

First an Old Testament text to suit our Calvinist tastes: 'I have set my affection to the house of my God.'¹ Dr A.K.H. Boyd of St Andrews preached from this text at the re-opening of Anderston (St Martin's), Glasgow, in 1869.

Disclaimer

Two vital questions that require adequate answers are not addressed by this essay. First, both a theology of aesthetics proper to reformed Presbyterian Scots and that expressed by Scottish ecclesiologists. Second, a critical examination

of the idea of Dr Andrew L. Drummond that there is a specifically Protestant Church Architecture.² This view surfaces again in the writings of Professor James Whyte and others, 'outing' those practising ecclesiologists who expressed a deeply catholic understanding along with their loyalty to Scotland and its Reformation.

I hope to demonstrate that for Scottish church people an historically informed, active engagement in ecclesiological tasks is neither a luxury, an eccentricity, nor a churchy type of antiquarianism. My plan is to trace the development of ecclesiology in Scotland and the way in which members of this Society have stimulated and participated in that development. Appropriate buzz words are **awe** and **mystery**, **beauty** and **the beauty of holiness** and **church with walls**.

Definitions

'Manna' is used in the title to express two thoughts. First, the literal translation of the Hebrew 'what is it?' allows a broad definition. Second, it expresses my belief that the story of Scotland's ecclesiastical sites and buildings and their furnishings is God-given, part of his providential provision for our earthly pilgrimage. Increasingly throughout the 20th century, the term 'ecclesiology' was exploited by dogmatic and symbolic theologians: for example, former President T.F. Torrance and Karl Rahner. However, the Oxford Dictionary published in 1990 is clear that the secondary meaning is 'theology as applied to the nature and structure of the Christian Church.'³

The word began to be used in the late 1830s.⁴ From 1839, it was taken up and promoted by the Cambridge Camden Society of John Mason Neale and Benjamin Webb until the late 1860s.⁵ An Ecclesiological Society (founded 1879) continues to flourish, with an active publishing programme, in England today. Its primary meaning is 'the study of churches [especially church building and decoration].'⁶

The best short definition of the Scottish Ecclesiological Societies is by Dr Douglas Murray from the *Dictionary of Scottish Church History and Theology*:

It was one of the first meeting grounds between Presbyterians, Episcopalians and RCs in Scotland. ... Its objects were the study of

the 'Principles of Christian Worship and of Church Architecture and its allied Arts, which are the handmaids of devotion', and the 'diffusion throughout Scotland of sound views, and a truer taste in such matters'. Cooper did not wish the societies to be merely gatherings of antiquarians but rather agencies to help members gain inspiration from the study of ancient buildings in order to provide for the religious needs of their own day.⁷

We may trace 3 phases of the ecclesiological story in Scotland.

1. Before the Societies: late c18th – 1886: Roman Catholic, Scottish Episcopal and Established Church of Scotland. While most early nineteenth century Roman Catholic chapels in Scotland were as plain and unobtrusive as St Peter, Dalbeattie (1814), ecclesiological church building could be said to have begun with the Roman Catholics. We see the influence of the training of candidates for the priesthood in the Scots Colleges in Paris and Rome in the uninhibited design of St Gregory, Preshome, Moray (1788), remarkable for its construction before the repeal of most penal laws relating to Scots Roman Catholics in 1793, and credited by Mark Dilworth as the first purpose-built post-Reformation chapel in Scotland.⁸ From early in the nineteenth century, the Scottish Episcopal Church built Gothic revival churches, for example, William Burn's un-Scottish perpendicular St John the Evangelist, Princes St, Edinburgh (1814-18). Tristram Clarke and Allan Maclean have carefully traced the strong influence of the Cambridge Camden Society on episcopalian ecclesiology, expressed by the building of St John's, Jedburgh (1844) by John Hayward of Exeter for the Marchioness of Lothian.⁹ The impact, especially within the established Church of Scotland, of the work of the 'father of Scottish ecclesiology', Leith wine merchant, Thomas Smyth Muir (1803-88), was impeded by the consequences of the 1843 Disruption.¹⁰

2. The Ecclesiological Societies: 1886 - 1965. The *Index to Transactions* was published in 1971.

3. Ecclesiology since 1965.

Contemporary issues

While I shall not address specifically issues that belong to the remits of the

General Trustees, the Assembly's Committee on Church Art and Architecture and other agencies of the Church of Scotland, I do have a number of concerns.¹¹ First, so many of our church leaders and members seem to be empty of ecclesiological awareness. There is need for education to raise levels of awareness and knowledge.

Second, there is a lot of worry about finance – the cost of the upkeep of the ecclesiastical component of our built heritage. We fool ourselves if we think that it was easy for our Victorian predecessors. There may have been a fair number of churchgoers with sizeable disposable wealth to contribute to the restoring or building of churches, or the placing of memorials in the form of stained glass windows, pulpits, fonts, communion tables, etc. But today there is a wide range of funding available from outside congregational and local community resources. Applying for that grant funding is a complex and time consuming process – but John Macleod of Govan,¹² Playfair of St Andrews¹³ and Maclean and Howell of Paisley Abbey¹⁴ would have stories to tell of how demanding it was to raise huge sums of money, in addition to the annual financial requirements of parish and congregational life.

Third, the ambivalence of informality is perhaps a good thing: to be relaxed, not so much rigid as 'cool'. My fear is that 'informality' is often an excuse for unnecessary clutter, or for the slovenly, used to justify the second-rate to the fourth-rate – in language, music, art – and, even, theology!

Ecclesiological vacuum

There is a serious and significant contemporary ecclesiological vacuum. Granted, there is a network of local history groups, the work of NADFAS recorders, the sterling work by Edwina Proudfoot and Scottish Church Heritage Research Ltd, of the Scotland's Churches Scheme,¹⁵ and, of course, the Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland. But none of these are direct expressions of the life of the Church, or places in which the professional interest of ministers and other church leaders may be captured, motivated and inspired. There is little expectation that Church of Scotland ministers should be ecclesologically aware.

It is hardly surprising that there was an ecclesiological vacuum in Scotland

before the science of ecclesiology was invented in England and Scotland in the 1840s. As the 1700s turned into the 1800s, many surviving¹⁶ medieval parish churches across Scotland were demolished or abandoned to make way for newer structures.¹⁷ For example Govan (Lanarkshire),¹⁸ Killean (on the westward side of the Kintyre peninsula),¹⁹ Abernethy (Perthshire),²⁰ Inveresk (or Musselburgh),²¹ Buittle (Kirkcudbrightshire)²² and Thurso (Caithness).²³ It is not clear that none of these medieval buildings could have been saved. At Govan, the church built in 1762 during the ministry of William Thom was itself condemned structurally and demolished in 1825.²⁴ The medieval parish church of Killean (Argyll) was abandoned in 1770, apparently for safety reasons, twenty-one years before the building of a new church. Abernethy church, probably incorporating part of a pre-Reformation collegiate church, was demolished in 1802. A huge preaching box was built in 1805 at Inveresk by the great moderate and enlightenment figure, Dr Alexander 'Jupiter' Carlyle. Buittle was not replaced until 1817-19. Thurso's much altered medieval parish church was in use until 1832, when it was replaced as part of Sir John Sinclair of Ulbster's 1798 development, inspired by Edinburgh's new town.

Sightseeing in England shortly after the bloody fiasco on Culloden Moor in 1746, Alexander Carlyle, in his mid-20s, and a friend 'were really astonished' by the Oxford colleges.²⁵ Perhaps more influential in forming his architectural taste was a journey home from London in 1758 in the company of Robert Adam's younger brother, James, visiting Bulstrode, Oxford, Blenheim Palace, and Warwick. Carlyle's description of the much altered medieval church of St Michael at Inveresk suggests Roman bricks and stone were used in its construction.²⁶ Long-term Secretary of the Scottish Ecclesiological Society, James Wilkie, accused Dr Carlyle of participating in the act of ruthless vandalism that removed the ancient medieval church of St Michael on the hill at Inveresk:

Surely Sir Walter [Scott] was justified in his opinion. Had Jupiter been more a poet than his precentor, the age-worn shrine, hallowed by the memories of so many centuries, where, in the days when the ancient faith was still the faith of Scotland, the monks chanted and the incense rose in clouds before the High Altar, while the people bent in adoring awe, would yet have crowned the hill, though the growing population necessitated a supplementary place of worship in the town itself.²⁷

Such yearning for a lost medieval age makes us think of a sterile antiquarianism

that Dr James Cooper and his practical architect friends would have condemned.

Former Vice-President Thomas Leishman (1899-1903) offered illuminating comment in 1890:

Church architecture is a matter of much less importance than the edification of the living church, ... Down to the middle of the [eighteenth] century most of the ancient churches of Scotland were standing. Small and plain as many of them were, their structural features fixed their date. The honest workmanship prevented their falling into ruin, and there was no thought of demolishing them so long as they were sufficient for shelter on one day of the week. When alterations were needed, no one saw anything unseemly in mean material or incongruous arrangement. Thatch took the place of lead or stone. When fixed seats came into use, the interior was blocked above and below with strange erections in woodwork. If light and access were wanted, doorways and windows, for which the village street supplied models, were broken out in the tough walls. Still the building was revered for its associations apart from all questions of ugliness or beauty. ... There is no reason why most of these churches should not have been standing now, like others of the same date in other countries. But the ambition of the young clergy of that day was to be reckoned men of taste, superior to prejudice, and abreast of the spirit of the time. The *mode* was to treat mediaeval architecture as something barbaric. Therefore the first object of such a man, when he entered on a living, was to have the gloomy old “kirk and queir” removed to make way for a snug modern edifice, which, if the heritors were frugal, took the form of a quadrangle, containing the maximum of sitting room with the minimum of assessment; if they were generous, was built on some bastard classical design. Fortunately their construction was generally such as to guarantee their speedy decay.²⁸

Phase 1: before the ecclesiological societies

The ministry of Dr Robert Lee at the Kirk of the Greyfriars demonstrates that liturgical effort and a keen interest in the context of worship – the building – are inseparable. The first edition of Lee’s *Prayers for Public Worship* was published in 1857,²⁹ ‘the year of the “restoration” of his kirk of *Old Greyfriars*’.³⁰ One of Lee’s achievements was to pioneer the installation of stained glass windows in the post-Reformation Established Church of Scotland.³¹ He defended his decision not to ask for permission –

before perpetrating so daring an outrage upon inveterate custom and feeling. Not choosing to ask liberty to do what was not prohibited by any law; and averse to put the Church Courts in a delicate position, we proceeded upon our own responsibility; thus setting an example which has been extensively followed – in some cases with great splendour, and at vast expense – and which the most timid and conservative Doctors among us do not now scruple to follow, by having their own churches ornamented in the same way.³²

We understand that the ecclesiastical stories of England and Scotland are significantly different, but that is not reflected fully in most recent writing on ecclesiastical architecture, especially in the otherwise splendid *Buildings of Scotland* series and the Thames & Hudson world of art volume on *Scottish Architecture*.³³ The assumption that Scottish Ecclesiology is essentially the English Ecclesiological movement in Scotland is not well founded.³⁴ We may as well begin with that great Victorian gossip, Dr A.K.H. Boyd, of Holy Trinity, St Andrews, Vice-President (1874-98), quoting his 1869 sermon at the opening of the new church in Anderston, Glasgow.

It is well known to all who are interested in the Church of Scotland, that for several years past there has existed a strong desire in many of her members and ministers, both for more solemn and decorous places of worship than have hitherto been common in this country, and likewise for greater propriety and dignity in the forms and arrangements of the worship itself. The rude and ugly buildings, which since the Reformation have been good enough to serve as churches, are being slowly superseded by others with some pretensions to architectural grace and beauty; though still sadly inferior to the churches of the Middle Ages.³⁵

An 1863 [anonymous] pamphlet of George Washington Sprott (President 1907-09) led three other young ministers to found this Society two years later. Part of his purpose in publicising his views is 'to try to divert the tendency to improvement or change away from Anglicanism to the primitive and to the Continental Reformed Church.'³⁶ While mostly concerned with the structure and content of services of worship, he discusses the use of apses.³⁷ Following that discussion, Sprott continues: 'There are other points in connection with church architecture to which I shall not allude; but it appears to me that if our Scottish architects were more familiar with the history and ideas of the Reformed Church, several great improvements, both as regards beauty and convenience,

might be effected.’³⁸ Sprott is concerned to counter Tractarianism, and does not mince his words: ‘Deference to Anglicanism in the Church of Scotland is a crime.’³⁹

Dr Sprott identified a need for more suitable places of worship as part of a strategy to capture and hold the interest of people attracted by episcopalianism and ‘the prevailing unbelief of the age, and the so-called liberal theology which is at present finding fullest expression in these Nonconformist communions, but from which our own Church is by no means free’.⁴⁰ ‘There can be no doubt that the majority of our people are longing for better churches, and for more orderly, reverent, and hearty worship.’⁴¹ These ideas are amplified in his lectures, published 1882 as *The Worship and Offices of the Church of Scotland*. Sprott traces the neglect of church buildings by the powerful laity from Reformation times to the heritors of his own day:

All this is mortifying enough of itself, and it does not improve matters to hear Heritors coolly attributing to the genius of Presbyterianism what is due to their own *genius* or to see them leaving the Parish Churches because of discomforts, and even horrors, which they are bound to improve.⁴²

In 1863, Sprott had discussed appropriate Presbyterian use of the basilican apse. He now states that medieval architecture and Presbyterian practice are not incompatible:

There is nothing in our system inconsistent with the noblest style of architecture – nothing to prevent our utilising all the parts of a Gothic Cathedral, though perhaps the earliest form of the Christian Church, the Basilica, suits best our worship, the means at our disposal, and our traditions. The finest Reformed Churches in the world are the old Swiss Cathedrals, such as that of Basel. In Holland there are also many noble and stately cruciform churches, the chancel, or head of the Cross, being used for the Communion, as was the case in Scotland after the Reformation.⁴³

Principal Peter Colin Campbell of Aberdeen University (President 1873-77) took the opportunity of the opening of a new University library in 1871 to have King’s College Chapel ‘liberated from end to end to subserve its original purpose’ two years later.⁴⁴ His article on the heraldic ceiling in the nave of

St Machar's, Old Aberdeen, dated 26 July 1867,⁴⁵ is more than an historical treatise on the intrinsic merits of the ceiling. The opportunity was taken of major repairs to the roof and ceiling for close inspection and an accurate account of the forty-eight heraldic shields, including discussion of 'some strange mistakes' of a previous painter 'manifestly altogether ignorant of [the colours used in] heraldry'.⁴⁶

Dr William Duke (Secretary 1873-87, appointed Vice-President 1905) initiated the 1871-72 restoration of St Vigean's, Arbroath, the first restoration of a church by young architect, Robert Rowand Anderson.⁴⁷ Dr Duke was credited by contemporaries with undertaking the first careful and appropriate restoration of an historic Scottish parish church.⁴⁸

Phase 2: CSS and the formation of the ecclesiological societies

While James Cooper has been credited with being the sole begetter of the ecclesiological societies,⁴⁹ three young architect friends, Charles Carmichael, William Kelly, and A. Marshall Mackenzie, were 'part of the process'. Using Cooper's contacts, membership of the Aberdeen Ecclesiological Society (founded 1886) was scattered across the length and breadth of Scotland. More than a third of those who joined in the first year were members of the Church Service Society, including founder, George Campbell of Eastwood, instigator, Dr George W. Sprott, experienced churchmen like Professor William Milligan of Aberdeen University and Dr William Duke of St Vigean's and three laymen, Cooper's cousin John Wink (Elgin), Dr James A. Campbell, MP (Brechin) and Sheriff W.G. Scott Moncrieff (Falkirk).⁵⁰

It was a similar story among the founders of the Glasgow Ecclesiological Society (1893): twelve existing Aberdeen members were joined by seventeen Church Service Society members in the Glasgow and surrounding area.⁵¹ When the two societies merged to become the Scottish Ecclesiological Society (1903), the membership of the new national society included at least fifty-six members of the Church Service Society.⁵² Most became members of the Church Service Society first, but in a few cases it was the other way round. Of those members of the Church Service Society who joined the Aberdeen, Glasgow and Scottish Ecclesiological Societies, there were seven successive Secretaries from 1865 to 1927, and five successive Presidents from 1907 to 1930.

Former President, Alastair K. Robertson, interpreted the Ecclesiological Societies as an expression of the nineteenth century revival in worship, further feeding that revival:

Cleaner and better appointed churches became general. Churches were beginning to resemble places of worship, rather than mere auditoria. Chancels, stained glass, Holy Tables, robed choirs, even prayer-desks appeared. ... Churches had been built, or were to be built, which were noble expressions of the highest ideals of the revival of worship. But many of the new churches now seem heavy, pretentious, fussy in decoration and redolent of a sentimental piety.⁵³

I wish to look briefly at four ways in which Church Service Society members made their contribution: through Society publications, in the building of new churches, and in the furnishing and restoration of churches.

The role of the CSS in publicising ecclesiological matters

In his 1912 Presidential Address to the Scottish Ecclesiological Society, Professor James Cooper, Convener of the Editorial Committee 1915-21, discussed the nature of Christian worship and church architecture, listing church music, stained glass, woodcarving, embroidery and linen, metalwork, painting and sculpture, 'The Fine Arts as Handmaids to the Worship of the Church'.⁵⁴ The publications of the Church Service Society have usually included information, with illustration, on the context in which worship is conducted – the church building: *The Annual* (1928-70), *Liturgical Review* (1971-81)⁵⁵ and (to a lesser extent) *The Record* from 1982.

The first number of *The Annual* set the standard by including a large number of items of ecclesiological interest. The restorations of Paisley Abbey⁵⁶ and St Cuthbert's, Dalmeny;⁵⁷ 'the Transformation of a country church' (the Chapel of Garioch); an article on 'The Holy Table'; an 'Order for the Dedication of a Stained-Glass Window' and an illustrated note on a new Communion Table and mosaics for the east end of St Columba's, Pont Street, London.⁵⁸ The second number published the recently-completed restorations at St John's, Perth⁵⁹ and Kippen.⁶⁰ Defying the constraints and economies of wartime, *The Annual* appeared, describing St Michael's, Linlithgow;⁶¹ St Salvator's Chapel, University of St Andrews;⁶² Fowlis Wester;⁶³ and Uphall.⁶⁴ Dr William McMillan (President

1940-42) supplied articles on 'The Communion Table and its Furnishings',⁶⁵ 'The Baptismal Font'⁶⁶ and 'Liturgical Colours in Scottish Parish Churches'.⁶⁷ Other matters of ecclesiological interest, for example, the placing of organs, music, ministerial dress, embroidered items and communion linen, are not covered by this article.⁶⁸

The Editorial introducing *Liturgical Review* indicates the Society's continuing interest in ecclesiology: '... and discussions of matters of good order in church architecture and furnishing are also acceptable. It is hoped to continue the descriptions of famous or interesting places of worship which have been a notable feature of the *Annual* in former years.'⁶⁹ That first number included a description of Ladykirk⁷⁰ in the Borders and articles on 'Voluntaries for the Small Organ and the Modest Player'⁷¹ and 'Symbolism in Church Architecture'.⁷² The promised article on the churches of Frederick Pilkington appeared in the fourth number.⁷³ At first, the *Record* rarely published items of ecclesiological interest. An exception was the sermon on the Tercentenary of the Canongate.⁷⁴ A special edition of *The Record* focused on the life and work of Dr James Cooper, illustrated through the generosity of a member of Council with ecclesiological illustrations.⁷⁵ Professor Bernard Reymond's Centenary Lecture, 'The Reformed worship buildings: architectural and theological meanings'⁷⁶ was accompanied by responses from Professor James Whyte and former President Dr Henry Sefton.⁷⁷

The *Annual* regularly included reviews of books of ecclesiological interest. Examples are Dr Arthur B. Dalgetty's *History of the Church of Fowlis Easter* with coloured illustrations of the medieval paintings⁷⁸ and Dr W. McMillan's review of three additions to the Batsford British Heritage series 'worthy of the highest praise', *The Cathedrals of England*, *The English Abbey* and *Parish Churches*.⁷⁹ Book reviews with an ecclesiological flavour include Dr Francis C. Eeles in 1950 on the first published volume in the *Oxford History of English Art*, by Joan Evans, covering the period 1307-1461⁸⁰ and in 1954 on the third volume by T.S.R. Boase, covering the years 1100-1216.⁸¹ Published in 1957 were reviews by Dr J. Arnott Hamilton on *The Architecture of Scottish Post-Reformation Churches, 1560-1843* by George Hay, Dr John A. Lamb on the second edition of *Byzantine Architecture and Decoration* by Dr J.A. Hamilton, and Dr William D. Maxwell on the Twelfth Report of the Central Council for the Care of Churches in England, founded by Dr Eeles.⁸² Former President, James Stewart, recently

noted⁸³ the 'modified warmth' of the review by Dr W. McMillan of *The Church Architecture of Protestantism* by Dr A.L. Drummond. He queries whether the argument of the book was 'too 'liberal' or too 'aesthetic''. Davidson Kelly's tabletalk in the 1960s made it clear to me that it was because his analysis was narrowly Protestant, and did little to support the advances in church worship and architecture promoted and achieved by the Church Service Society and the Scottish Ecclesiological Society. Most recently, titles on church architecture were included in 'A Selective Reading List' in *The Record* 40, in which there was a review of books on Paisley Abbey and King's College Chapel, Aberdeen.⁸⁴

Readers were introduced to new churches and provided with descriptions of existing buildings. Work at existing churches is variously described as restoration, re-ordering and renovation.

(a) New buildings. Members were introduced to an interesting range of contemporary designs, but often some years after completion. St Andrew's, the Scots Memorial Church in Jerusalem, was the first new church building described (within two years of its dedication in 1930) by Ninian Hill, Convener of the Editorial Committee 1927-28, and first editor of *The Annual* (1928-29).⁸⁵ A description of the 1891 mission church at Blantyre was published after forty years of use.⁸⁶ St Conan's Kirk, Loch Awe, and its range of furnishings garnered from across Scotland, product of the extraordinary imagination of Walter Douglas Campbell and completed by his sister Helen, was described within five years of completion.⁸⁷ During the 1960s, three modern churches in New Zealand (the earliest 1923), were brought to the attention of Scottish readers.⁸⁸ Reid Memorial, Edinburgh was described on completion,⁸⁹ while St Margaret's, Knightswood, opened 1932, was not described until 1961.⁹⁰

A new style of post-war church extension church building was first noticed with Colinton Mains, Edinburgh by George Hay of Ian G. Lindsay & Partners.⁹¹ Shortly after its dedication on 4 December 1955, the rebuilding (following destruction by incendiary bombs in May 1941) of St Columba's, Pont Street, London by the architect of Guildford Cathedral was reported.⁹² The design of St Columba's, Glenrothes, 1960-61, by Kirkcaldy architects, Wheeler & Sproson, in association with Professor James Whyte and others from the University of St Andrews, was in tune with a changing mood at odds with the insights of Scottish ecclesiologists:

The architecture of the Church arises simply and directly from its plan in a form to satisfy the needs of Presbyterian worship. Of late, there has been a growing realisation that many Churches do not meet these requirements and that the spirit and form of the worship has suffered thereby.⁹³

The second number of *Liturgical Review* showed one interior and two exterior illustrations of Craigsbank, Corstorphine, Edinburgh, 1965-66.⁹⁴ East Kilbride South and Cumbernauld, St Mungo's, two of the three churches illustrated in *Liturgical Review*, May 1976, had been built in developing New Towns.⁹⁵

(b) Restorations reported included Paisley Abbey at the time of the rededication of the choir on 1 December 1928⁹⁶ and Dalmeny at the completion of work on the chancel and the start of work on the nave in the first edition of *The Annual*,⁹⁷ Kippen⁹⁸ and St John's Kirk, Perth⁹⁹ in the second. Criticism of earlier nineteenth century restorations surfaces in the description of the Old Parish Church (St John the Baptist) in Corstorphine, Edinburgh: '... the greatest act of vandalism was reserved for William Burn, the architect, whose heavy hand had already been laid upon S. Giles' and Dunfermline Abbey.'¹⁰⁰ The restoration by architect George Henderson, completed in 1905, is described as bringing 'back seemliness, strength, and beauty to this ancient house of God.' The 1919 restoration at Symington, Ayrshire for John Gage Boyd by Peter Macgregor Chalmers was not published until 1951, following the installation of a new communion table, prayer desk and elders' stalls.¹⁰¹ Similarly, the ambitious 1926 restoration of St Fillan's, Aberdour, abandoned in 1796, was not published for 20 years.¹⁰² The 1948-52 restoration of the medieval chapel of St Leonard, St Andrews, by Ian G. Lindsay was written up almost immediately.¹⁰³

(c) Early publication of renovations and re-ordering. 'Thorough work' (1870-71) of architect David Bryce had saved St Mary's, Biggar, but had 'produced a very dull, if comfortable interior.' The 1935-36 "restoration" was reported in *The Annual* in 1947.¹⁰⁴ The description of the Kirk of the Greyfriars was published soon after the 1912 pulpit had been moved and remodelled, with a new back and sounding boards designed by Greyfriars elder George Hay.¹⁰⁵ Readers learnt within three years of completion of the 1955 renovation of Coldingham Priory by Gordon & Dey, building on the 1854 renovation.¹⁰⁶ At Ellon, a new entrance, pulpit, pulpit fall, Bible markers and stained glass, all part of 'a most extensive plan of renovation costing £22,000', completed 1968, was

published the following year.¹⁰⁷ The ambitious two-year renovation programme at Old Luce included a more spacious entrance vestibule, stained glass, new organ, changes to the galleries, new pulpit and pulpit fall, communion table and font in a new chancel, with a round stained glass window from Ladyburn Church above.¹⁰⁸

(d) Descriptions provided information about dedications (where relevant), architecture, history, changes in worship and furnishings. Examples of descriptions of medieval buildings are Stobo Kirk,¹⁰⁹ Whitekirk,¹¹⁰ and King's College, Aberdeen.¹¹¹ Opportunity was taken of the 80th anniversary of its dedication to describe St Magnus Cathedral, Orkney.¹¹² Simple descriptions include an illustrated note on The Tron Kirk, Edinburgh;¹¹³ Caputh;¹¹⁴ St Bride's, Sanquhar;¹¹⁵ St Leonard's, St Andrews;¹¹⁶ St Leonard's, Dunfermline;¹¹⁷ St Columba's, Saltcoats¹¹⁸ (all three by Peter Macgregor Chalmers); Bowden, Borders,¹¹⁹ including useful information about the 1909 restoration by Peter Macgregor Chalmers; and St Cuthbert's, Melrose.¹²⁰ Descriptions of buildings furth of Scotland include two Scots Kirks in Holland, at Amsterdam and Rotterdam, the former a medieval building, the latter only some five years old at the time of writing¹²¹ and Princeton University Chapel.¹²² The 1960 article on Dunblane Cathedral¹²³ quotes the opinion of John Ruskin: 'I know not anything so perfect in its simplicity and so beautiful ... in all the Gothic with which I am acquainted.' Durisdeer was featured in 1966,¹²⁴ essentially a description, but on verge of an ambitious scheme to upgrade the schoolhouse accommodation, bringing more into better use, and Skelmorlie in 1967.¹²⁵ The final issue of *The Annual* included a description of Brechin Cathedral.¹²⁶

As promised by the first editorial, *Liturgical Review* continued to publish descriptions including The Holy Rude, Stirling¹²⁷ and St Nicholas Church with St Mary's Chapel¹²⁸ and the Triple Kirks, Aberdeen.¹²⁹ Opportunity was taken of the 75th anniversary of the 1898-99 restoration, and of more than 500 years since the original dedication, to include a description of Crichton, Lothian.¹³⁰

Scottish cultural identity and the Royal Scottish Academy

Concerns have been expressed at the way in which Scottish Ecclesiologists were unpatriotic. However, direct English influence has often been overstated. A significant number of influential members of the Scottish Ecclesiological

Society, architects as well as artists, were at the centre of Scotland's cultural life through their membership of the Royal Scottish Academy.¹³¹ Sir David Young Cameron, RA, RSA, LLD, a son of the United Presbyterian Manse, gave his Presidential Address to the Scottish Ecclesiological Society on 20 May 1935.¹³² An expanded and updated version was published in *The Annual* seven years later during the second world war.¹³³ One of the concerns of this active elder was the level of ignorance and bad taste in Scotland, and the need to educate church leaders and ministers. He had been involved in the careful 1924-26 restoration of his local parish church, Kippen near Stirling, by Roman Catholic architect Reginald Fairlie.¹³⁴

Building and furnishing churches – awe and mystery; beauty and the beauty of holiness

St Leonard's, Dunfermline was dedicated in 1904. Five years after the death of architect Peter Macgregor Chalmers, his simple design of the Risen Christ surrounded by New Testament figures for the semi-dome or ceiling of the apse was executed by Mr A. Samuel, head of the local Craft School.¹³⁵ Dr William McMillan himself crafted some of the furnishings in the church, including the lectern and wooden font cover.¹³⁶ The Beadle proudly shared with me a glorious legend, which might not have amused Dr McMillan, that eminent student and practitioner of worship. The St Leonard's children are taught that the font cover carvings hold mystical secrets. Symbolic meaning, perhaps, but Da Vinci Code secret, never!

One of the tragedies of down-sizing the national stock of church buildings is the loss of so many of the churches with a liturgical tradition, expressive of a deeply catholic theology.¹³⁷ In the wider Govan parish area, three churches have been demolished, and one is in secular, Asian ownership: Oatlands and the three churches designed in the 1890s by Peter Macgregor Chalmers for John Macleod's second church extension programme.¹³⁸ John Macleod was very proud of what the people of Oatlands had achieved under the leadership of Arthur W. Wotherspoon.¹³⁹ The daughter churches in west Partick, south Govan and Polmadie had each been staffed by one of John Macleod's assistants and used the Govan service. In 1971, only a few years before Glasgow Presbytery, under Andrew Herron's leadership, dissolved St Bride's, Charles Inglis wrote in *Liturgical Studies* about the responsive service, with monthly Communion,

set in 'a building in which the Catholic tradition of worship would be fully effected.'¹⁴⁰

Features of the three church extension churches in Partick, Polmadie and south Govan included seats, rather than fixed pews – to provide flexibility (no Camdenian doctrinaire condemnation of pews); an area marked off for Baptism, in an apse in the three churches designed by Peter Macgregor Chalmers; and the integral use of stained glass, even where the budget allowed the installation of only one or two windows. Side aisles could be used to enhance flexibility: the side aisle in St Bride's, Partick was used for services with smaller numbers.

Three architects deeply involved in the ecclesiological societies between 1886 and 1940 demonstrate artistic excellence in their attention to detail, skill in design, and sometimes reference to local designs by an earlier generation. Unobtrusive designs by founder members of the Aberdeen Society, William Kelly¹⁴¹ and A. Marshall Mackenzie,¹⁴² and Glasgow architect, Peter Macgregor Chalmers,¹⁴³ illustrate this point. For the design of the pulpit at Symington, Ayrshire, Macgregor Chalmers used the round headed windows in the east gable wall.¹⁴⁴ Dr Macgregor Chalmers used ogee arches in the design of pulpit and communion table in Kilmichael Glassary, Argyll, probably influenced by Scottish medieval precedent rather than by Islamic architecture examined during a Moroccan holiday.

Provision of lecterns did not arise from a desire to imitate the practice of other churches. It was part of the rediscovery of the celebration in worship of the primacy of the Word of God. It is hard for a twenty-first century mind to grasp that the reading of scripture as part of the main Sunday service was neglected through the eighteenth into the nineteenth century: '... it was only in 1856 that the General Assembly enjoined the reading of Holy Scripture at every service. That also was an innovation from established practice.'¹⁴⁵ Dr McMillan outlined the medieval situation,¹⁴⁶ describing modern lecterns made of brass and wood. Macgregor Chalmers designed a number of metal lecterns including Stepps, St Margaret's, Polmadie and St Leonard's, St Andrews. Dr McMillan reports another at Torryburn.¹⁴⁷ Wrought iron work gifted 1967 to Monymusk Priory by a skilled local blacksmith included a metal lectern.¹⁴⁸

The collaboration at Kippen during the 1920s between Sir David Young

Cameron and Roman Catholic architect, Reginald Fairlie,¹⁴⁹ expressed the ecumenical dimension of the Scottish Ecclesiological Societies. The Societies provided a safe place where people from different traditions might meet, and, through sharing a common interest and purpose, the opportunity to develop relationships across complicated denominational barriers.

Partly in response to the devastation of a second world war, Cameron looked back to a time when Art was used by the Christian Church:

It is impossible to emphasise too strongly that the Church is and must remain the heart of the world, and, notwithstanding the shadow of these dark years of evil, will continue to be the defender of the highest life of the people, and in the near future, as once it was, the home of the highest art. ... Once the Church was the chiefest friend of all the Arts, and the Arts found their utmost joy in the service of the Church. ... Too often have the Arts been cast aside in fear or scorn – a scorn bred of ignorance – until they were finally divorced with serious loss on either hand. ... Will the Church consider this other way of expressing belief by way of outward and visible signs, and thus save for itself many who have withdrawn from its worship and await the return of more poetry and mystery, which may contribute so much to the sense of the supernatural, essential for those spirits who enter the Holy of Holies by the doorway of Art? ... We cannot aim too high, and must recover the spirit of the golden age of Art in the Church ... Are we able to recapture this joyful spirit, ...? Can our Divinity Halls teach something of this to our young clergy and can the clergy teach the people?¹⁵⁰

We have seen that the first stained glass windows in the post-Reformation Established Church of Scotland were installed in Greyfriars, Edinburgh during the ministry of Dr Robert Lee. The story of the stained glass at Glasgow Cathedral provides a cautionary tale, twice: first in the use of one studio (1859-64) and second in removing the majority of that glass (1930s-50s). The original scheme was controversial in that British artists, including James Ballantine of Edinburgh, were deselected by the committee in favour of the Munich workshops.¹⁵¹ To provide so much glass in one style was to court disaster, given technical production problems and Glasgow pollution. In reporting the process of replacing the Munich glass in the centenary edition of *The Annual*, Nevile Davidson stressed that the Society of Friends of Glasgow Cathedral were careful to leave windows with clear glass to be filled in the future: ‘... it would

be both selfish and short-sighted for one generation to reglaze all the principal windows, thus leaving no opportunity for succeeding generations.’¹⁵² To analyse the use made of both Scottish and English stained glass artists by members of the Church Service Society would make an interesting study in itself.

War memorials are a very specific item. Such memorials were placed within church grounds, on an inside wall as a tablet, in stained glass, or as a redesigned east end. The east end was redesigned by Peter Macgregor Chalmers at St Salvator’s College, St Andrews and Kelvinside Hillhead, Glasgow. The war memorial brought from Belmont to Kelvinside Hillhead, following the 1950 union, fits very snugly around the side door to the vestry and halls. However, the Belmont reredos, split into three parts, does not fit the east end, and obscures the simplicity and elegance of the 1923 redesign of the east end.¹⁵³ We are reminded to be cautious when assessing church design, and to be clear about exactly what was done at any one period and by which architect or designer. An exquisite war memorial chapel within the base of the eighteenth century tower at St Cuthbert’s, Edinburgh was designed by Peter Macgregor Chalmers for his cousin Dr Robert Howie Fisher (Secretary 1912-15).¹⁵⁴

Restoring churches – church with walls

Among the major restorations of Scotland’s historic churches by members of the Church Service Society already noticed are St Vigeans (Dr William Duke); St Michael’s, Linlithgow (Dr John Ferguson) and Symington, Ayrshire (John Gage Boyd). Brechin Cathedral (the work of Glasgow architect, Dr John Honeyman, completed in 1902) was begun by one member, John A. Clark, and completed by another, William W. Coats (President 1927-30).¹⁵⁵ Holy Trinity, St Andrews¹⁵⁶ and Paisley Abbey¹⁵⁷ were both restored by members of this Society, both using Glasgow architect, Peter Macgregor Chalmers. Part of the Paisley story was told in the last number of the *Record*.¹⁵⁸

Phase 3: conclusion

In conclusion, and partly in celebration of our 140th birthday this year, I would like to recall ‘Centenary Reflections’ by one of the ministers of The Kirk of the Grefyriars, Dr Stuart Loudon, President of the Society during the centenary year, who deeply influenced two young students for the ministry, Douglas Murray and myself:

The Society was founded in the era when the “restorations” of Scotland’s historic great churches was being undertaken. Also under the leadership of its members, fine new churches like Govan [John Macleod], the Barony of Glasgow [John Marshall Lang], and Edinburgh, St. Oswald’s [H.J. Wotherspoon] were built.¹⁵⁹

My prayer is that before we repeat the errors of Alexander ‘Jupiter’ Carlyle and William Thom and their generation, this Society will take up one of the four unfinished tasks identified by Dr Stuart Loudon:

One aspect of the Society’s present-day mission is to offer a more imaginative, informed and theologically sound leadership in ecclesiology to the Church of Scotland.¹⁶⁰

Let us pray.

Guide us, Lord,
in all our doings with your gracious favour,
and further us with your continual help;
that in all our works,
begun, continued, and ended in you,
we may glorify your holy name,
and by your mercy attain everlasting life;
though Jesus Christ our Lord. **AMEN.**¹⁶¹

Tom Davidson Kelly

Appendix 1

Members of the Church Service Society associated with the Ecclesiological Societies

1. i Members of the Church Service Society who joined the Aberdeen Ecclesiological Society in 1886, listed chronologically and by parish during the first year of CSS membership

1865 George Campbell, Eastwood, Secretary 1865-73 & Dr George W. Sprott, Portsmouth (Chapel of Garioch & North Berwick), President 1907-09; 1870 Dr William Duke, St Vigeans, Secretary 1873-87 [note Dr A.K.H. Boyd, St Andrews, Vice-President 1874-98, Moderator 1890, joined AES 1889]; 1872 David Bayne Jardine, Keir; 1873 Dr James Cooper, Broughty Ferry (East Church, Aberdeen & Glasgow University), Convener Editorial Committee 1915-21, Moderator of the General Assembly 1917; 1874 Duncan George Mearns, Oyne & Dr Pearson McAdam Muir, Polmont (Edinburgh & Glasgow Cathedral), Secretary 1887-1907, Convener Editorial Committee 1907-15, Moderator 1910; 1875 Prof William Milligan, Aberdeen, Moderator 1882; Dr James A. Campbell, MP, Brechin & Sheriff W.G. Scott Moncrieff, Falkirk; 1876 Duncan Campbell, Grahamston (Paris) 1880, Rosemount, Aberdeen 1882, St Matthew's, Edinburgh 1894); 1877 John Wink, Esq, Elgin; 1878 Arthur W. Wotherspoon, Beith (Oatlands, Glasgow 1883) & Dr Henry J. Wotherspoon, Hamilton (St Oswald's, Edinburgh 1894); 1879 James Smith, St George's (-in-the-West), Aberdeen; 1883 Dr John Calder, Old Machar & George Duncan, Maryculter; 1885 T. Newbigging Adamson, Broughty Ferry; James Brebner, Forgue, J.C. Carrick, Newbattle, John A. Clark, Coltness (Brechin Cathedral 1892) & G.A. Selbie, Clatt; 1887 Gordon J. Murray, Greyfriars, Aberdeen; 1888 Dr George Hutchison, Banchory-Ternan, Moderator 1887 & Dr Theodore Marshall, Caputh, Moderator 1908; 1890 Dr Roger S. Kirkpatrick, Dalbeattie (Govan 1898); 1893 Dr George Milligan, Edinburgh (Caputh & Glasgow University), Moderator 1923; 1894 Alex Dunn, Colombo, Ceylon and 1895 George Lawson, Forglen (Selkirk 1899).

1. ii Members of the Church Service Society who joined the Glasgow Ecclesiological Society (1893), listed chronologically by the first year of CSS membership

Existing members of the Aberdeen Society: 1870 Dr John Marshall Lang (AES 1890), Barony of Glasgow (Aberdeen University 1900) and Dr John Macleod (AES 1890), Duns (Govan 1875); 1875 Sheriff W.G. Scott Moncrieff, Falkirk; 1876 David Watson, Middle Parish, Paisley (St Oswald's, Woodlands, Glasgow 1877: AES 1887); 1878 A.W. Wotherspoon & Dr H.J. Wotherspoon; 1882 John Keith, Skelmorlie (Largs 1885); by 1882 John Kerr, Dirlerton, Treasurer 1882-1915; 1884 J. Dalrymple Duncan, Esq, Meiklewood, Stirling (AES 1893); 1899 Dr James Cromarty Smith, Alexandria (AES 1892); 1892 William H. Macleod, Buchanan, Drymen (AES 1892) & John Parker, Glasgow (AES 1892).

New members: 1865 Prof John Caird, Vice-President 1865-98, & Dr Donald Macleod, Linlithgow (Park, Glasgow 1869), President 1912-16, Moderator 1895; George S. Burns, Glasgow Cathedral, & William Ross, Polmont (Partick St Mary's 1893); 1875 Alexander Erskine Shand, North Parish, Greenock; 1879 John Alexander Ireland, Whitburn (Gartsherrie 1891) 1884 J.B.A. Watt, Cadder, Secretary 1907-11; 1886 G. Mure Smith, Stirling; 1888 W. Cairns Duncan, Ayr & Alfred Warr, Rosneath, Treasurer 1915-16; 1889 Archibald Grierson, Millport; 1891 S.P. McConnell, Pollokshaws; 1892 Thomas Swan, Esq, Airdrie (AES 1893); 1893 John Knox Brown, Langbank & Walter Edward Lee, Greenlaw, Paisley (St John's, Perth 1901); 1898 A.S. Dingwall Scott, Hamilton 1894 & 1906 James Mackie, Eastwood.

1. iii Members of the Church Service Society who joined the Scottish Ecclesiological Society (1903)

Members of the Aberdeen Ecclesiological Society: J. Brebner, Dr J.A. Campbell, MP, Patrick Cooper, Esq (1890 & CSS 1893), Alex Dunn, Dr Alexander Hetherwick (1890 & CSS Domasi 1889), Principal John Marshall Lang, Gordon J. Murray, James Smith, John Wink Esq.

Members of the Glasgow Ecclesiological Society: G. Campbell, Prof James Cooper, James D.G. Dalrymple, Esq, A. Grierson, J.A. Ireland, D. Bayne Jardine, Dr Roger S. Kirkpatrick, William A. Knowles, Grangemouth (CSS 1898 & Dalton 1918, President 1934-36), editor *Prayers for Divine Service* 1923 and 1929; J. Mackie, Dr G. Milligan, J. Parker, A.S. Dingwall Scott, Robert M. Sharpe (CSS Carstairs 1904), Dr J. Cromarty Smith, T. Swan, Esq, Alfred Warr, David Watson, J.B.A. Watt and Arthur W. Wotherspoon.

Members of the two Ecclesiological Societies in the Edinburgh area

(a) existing members: J.C. Carrick, Dr W. Duke, John Kerr (CSS Treasurer 1882-1915), G. Lawson, Dr Theodore Marshall, Dr G.W. Sprott, Dr H.J. Wotherspoon.

(b) others who joined the Societies later, but before 1903: 1887 Alex Young, Chapel of Garioch (CSS Colombo, Ceylon 1867) & A. Wallace Williamson, Edinburgh (CSS 1885, President 1916-27, Convener Editorial Committee 1921-23), Moderator 1913; 1888 Dr John McMurtrie, Edinburgh (CSS 1865, President 1909-12), Moderator 1904; 1889 J.R. Burt, Largo (CSS 1891) & North Berwick, Dr Walter William Coats, Brechin Cathedral (CSS Girthon 1881, President 1927-30); James F. Leishman, Linton (CSS Strathloch 1887); 1890 John Ferguson, Aberdalgie (CSS 1883) & John Caesar, Panbride, Carnoustie (CSS 1904) & Charles J. More Middleton, Crailing (CSS 1890); 1893 Dr George Marjoribanks, Stenton (CSS 1875) & Dr Archibald Fleming,

Tron, Edinburgh & St Columba's, Pont St, London (CSS Newton, Dalkeith 1888); 1894 Alexander M. Maclean, Cramond & Paisley Abbey 1910 (CSS Turriff 1889) & Dr Thomas Marjoribanks, Callander & Edinburgh (CSS Houndwood 1899, Secretary 1916-27, Editor of *The Annual* 1930, 1933-39 (and jointly 1931-33) and President 1932-34), Callander & Aberdeen & S.J. Ramsay Sibbald, Pollokshields (CSS Crathie 1898); 1896 Dr Marshall B. Lang, Whittinghame (CSS Old Meldrum 1896, Convener Editorial Committee 1923-27 and President 1942-44), Moderator 1935.

Among those who joined at the formation of the Scottish Society were: Dr Thomas Leishman (CSS Linton 1865, Vice-President 1899-1903, Moderator 1898); Dr Robert Howie Fisher, Edinburgh (CSS Skelmorlie 1887, Secretary 1912-15); Dr George Walker, East Church, Aberdeen (CSS 1889); Dr James M. Kirkpatrick, St Bride's, Partick (CSS 1907) & Caddonfoot, and Sir John Stirling Maxwell, MP, Pollok (CSS 1893). Dr T.E.S. Clarke, Saltoun (CSS 1886) joined 1904.

It should be noted that some ecclesiologically-minded members of the Church Worship Association of the United Free Church joined the CSS after the 1929 Union: for example the Very Reverend Principal Sir George Adam Smith, DD, who had joined the Aberdeen Society in 1886.

Members of the CSS would continue active involvement until the SES was wound up in the 1960s. For example Dr John Ferguson, Linlithgow (CSS 1879) & William George Black, Esq, Glasgow (CSS 1901) had joined by 1906 and Dr John Wilson Baird, St Machar's Cathedral, Aberdeen, (CSS President 1946-48), joined in 1924.

Appendix 2

Ecclesiologists associated with the Royal Scottish Academy

Dr William Kelly (co-founder Aberdeen 1886), ARSA 1911.

Dr A. Marshall Mackenzie (Aberdeen 1886), ARSA 1893, RSA 1918.

The Very Reverend Dr A. Wallace Williamson (Aberdeen 1887), Honorary Member 1911, Fifth Chaplain.

Dr John Honeyman (Aberdeen 1890), ARSA 1892, RSA 1896.

Sir George Reid (Aberdeen 1891), ARSA 1870, RSA 1877, 7th President RSA 1891-1902.

Sir John James Burnet (Aberdeen 1892), ARSA 1893; RSA 1914.

Sir Robert Rowand Anderson (Aberdeen 1893) ARSA 1876 (resigned 1883), Honorary Member 1897.

Hippolyte Jean Blanc (Glasgow 1893), ARSA 1892, RSA 1896, Treasurer 1907-17.

A.N. Paterson (Glasgow 1893), ARSA 1912.

John Kinross (Aberdeen 1894), ARSA 1893; RSA 1905, Treasurer 1924-31.

Prof G. Baldwin Brown (Scottish 1903) Hon Member 1911, Fifth Prof of Ancient History.

Dr Thomas Ross (Scottish 1903); Hon Member 1918, Sixth Prof of Antiquities.

Reginald Fairlie (Scottish by 1915), ARSA 1923, RSA 1934.

Sir David Young Cameron (Scottish by 1922), ARSA 1904, RSA 1918.

Sir Robert S. Lorimer (Scottish 1927 or 1928), ARSA 1903, RSA 1921.

1 1 Chronicles 29:3 (King James Version: New Revised Standard Version gives 'my devotion to the house of my God'), the text of *The Place of Ritual: a sermon preached at the re-opening of Anderston Church* [St Martin's], Glasgow, on Sunday, August 8, 1869. By the Revd A.K.H. Boyd, D.D. First minister of St. Andrews (London: Longmans, 1869), p.5. Quoted by A .K. Robertson in *The Annual* (hereafter *Annual*), 36, 1966, pp 8-9.

2 Andrew L. Drummond, 'Contrasting Tendencies in Protestant Church Architecture', *Annual*, 5, 1932-33, pp 37-53; *The Church Architecture of Protestantism* (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1934); 'The Public Worship of Presbyterian and other Reformed Churches in the United States', *Annual*, 9, 1936-37, pp 57-74, 63-64 and 73.

3 Concise Oxford Dictionary.

4 *Transactions of the Scottish Ecclesiological Society* (hereafter TSES), Vol 10, Part 1, 1930-31 (1931), p.6.

5 James F. White, *The Cambridge Movement: the ecclesiologists and the gothic revival* (Cambridge: University Press, 1962); Christopher Webster and John Elliott, eds, 'A Church as it Should be', *The Cambridge Camden Society and its influence* (Donnington: Shaun Tyas, 2000).

6 Concise Oxford Dictionary.

7 Douglas M. Murray, *Dictionary of Scottish Church History and Theology* (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1993). The best short account is A.K. Robertson, 'The Revival of Church Worship in the Church of Scotland from Dr Robert Lee (1804-67) to Dr H.J. Wotherspoon (1850-1930)', unpublished Edinburgh PhD thesis, 1956, pp 237-244 (narrative) and 258-9 (analysis).

8 Mark Dilworth, 'Roman Catholic Worship', Duncan B. Forrester & Douglas M. Murray, eds, *Studies in the History of Worship in Scotland* (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 2nd ed. 1996), p.139.

9 Tristram Clarke, 'A display of Tractarian energy: St John's Episcopal Church, Jedburgh', *Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, 27, 1997, pp 187-219 and Allan Maclean, 'The Scottish Episcopal Church and the Ecclesiological Movement 1840-1860', *Caledonia Gothica, Architectural Heritage, VIII* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997), pp 47-59. William Napier Bell had traced the development from 1837-79 of Anglican and Episcopalian ecclesiology through the pages of *The Ecclesiologist* in 'The Rise and Progress of Ecclesiology', *TSES*, Vol 10, Part 1, 1930-31 (1931), pp 6-32.

10 In the churchyard outside the Session House of Greyfriars Highland and Tolbooth Kirk, Edinburgh, lies the bachelor layman dubbed in his lifetime the Father of Scottish Ecclesiology, Thomas Smyth Muir (1802-1888), who published books and circulated privately printed pamphlets between the ages of 37 and 83. A *Ramble from Edinburgh to Durham* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh Printing Company, 1843) was completed a month before the Disruption in 1843 and six months before *The Ecclesiologist* reviewed John Mason Neale's apology for ecclesiology – *Hierologus or the church tourist. Descriptive Notices of some of the Ancient Parochial and Collegiate Churches of Scotland and Notes on Remains of Ecclesiastical Architecture and Sculptured Memorials in the Southern Division of Scotland* were published in 1848 and 1855 respectively. *Characteristics of Old Church Architecture in the Mainland and Western Islands of Scotland* (Edinburgh: Edmonston & Douglas, 1861) followed, and the majority of his 14 privately printed pamphlets (1858-79) were gathered together by his publisher David Douglas in *Ecclesiological Notes on some of the Islands of Scotland* (Edinburgh: David Douglas, 1885), three years before Muir's death. John Sanders, 'Ecclesiology in Scotland', Webster and Elliott, eds 2000, offers a misleading assessment of Thomas Muir. Although Muir stands squarely in the Scottish Antiquarian tradition, he promotes ecclesiology with its language and insights, developing it appropriately for Scotland, recording as many remote mainland and island chapels as was possible in his lifetime.

11 Some of these issues were discussed by Dr A. Ian Dunlop, 'The Fate of Church Buildings', *Liturgical Review* (hereafter *Lit. Rev.*), 7, 1, May 1977, pp 20-24.

12 Roger S. Kirkpatrick, *The Ministry of Dr John Macleod in the Parish of Govan* (Edinburgh & London: William Blackwood, 1915).

13 Roger S. Kirkpatrick, *The Ministry of Patrick Macdonald Playfair in St Andrews* (St Andrews: J & G Innes, 1930).

14 A.R. Howell, *Paisley Abbey: its History, Architecture, and Art* (Paisley: Alex Gardner, 1929).

15 Scotland's Churches Scheme, which allows new generations to discover the spiritual and heritage resources to which every church building in Scotland points, was anticipated in the 1970s by suggestions that the Church of the Holy Rude, Stirling and Crichton Collegiate Church were potential places of pilgrimage. C.B. Edie (*Lit. Rev.*, 3.1, May 1973, pp 47-51) quotes Dr Thomas Ross on the Holy Rude: 'Its state of preservation, its undoubted picturesque quality, and its unrivalled situation would all seem fitted to make it a place of pilgrimage.' John B. Logan (*Lit. Rev.*, 5.1, May 1975, pp 63-68) claims for Crichton: 'It has particular charm for sacramental and wedding services: the atmosphere of worship is exceptional: the air is full of the prayers of centuries and in conducting worship one feels spiritually uplifted. This could become a place of pilgrimage.'

16 The first generation of Scottish Reformers attempted to secure the medieval built heritage: 'Our first Reformers, instead of destroying the churches, as is ignorantly supposed, urged that they should be 'with expedition repaired, lest the word of God and ministration of the sacraments, by unseemliness of the place, should come into contempt.' – repaired not merely with a view to the comfort and convenience of the worshippers, but to what was due 'to the majesty of God.' *First Book of Discipline*, quoted by George W. Sprott, *The Church Principles of the Reformation* (Edinburgh & London: William Blackwood, 1877), p.14. 'There is a prevalent belief that all our old ecclesiastical buildings were destroyed in the 16th century by Knox and his fellow reformers, but this was not so. A candid examination of historical records reveals the fact that there was very little actual destruction wrought on the fabrics at the Reformation, though the furniture and fittings of many churches were completely destroyed.' Review of J.S. Coltart, *Scottish Church Architecture* (London: Sheldon Press [SPCK]) by Dr W. McMillan, *Annual*, 9, 1936-37, pp 84-85.

17 'Medieval churches were abandoned or pulled down in great numbers, without a second thought, and new buildings were substituted. It is to this period, a decade or two before and after 1800, that Scotland owes

- the large majority of the churches in her older parishes.' Ian G. Lindsay, *The Scottish Parish Kirk* (Edinburgh: St Andrew Press, 1960), p.68. While there is an identifiable national pattern, it is important to take into account regional variation. In Ayrshire there is some c17th replacement of medieval parish churches, in addition to Cromwell's occupation of St John Baptist, Ayr.
- 18 Sir John Sinclair, ed., *The Statistical Account of Scotland* (hereafter OSA), 14 (1795), pp 181-296 and James F. Leishman, *Matthew Leishman of Govan and the Middle Party of 1843* (Paisley: Alex Gardner, 1921), pp54, 70-71.
- 19 OSA, 8 (1792-95), pp 238-42, The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland, *Argyll, Volume 1, Kintyre* (Glasgow: HMSO, 1971), p.129 and T. Harvey Thomson, *The Ancient Churches and Chapels of Kintyre* (Campbeltown, 1934), pp 85-86.
- 20 OSA, 11 (1794), pp 430-448 & *New Statistical Account* (hereafter NSA), 10 (1845), pp 838-62.
- 21 OSA, 16 (1795), pp 1-49 & NSA, 1 (1845), pp 246-304.
- 22 OSA, 5 (1793), pp 49-71.
- 23 OSA, 20 (1798), pp 493-554 and NSA, 15 (1845), pp 1-12, and H. Gordon Slade and George Watson, 'St Peter's Kirk, Thurso, Caithness c1150-1832', *Proceedings of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland*, 119 (1989), pp 297-325.
- 24 Tom Davidson Kelly, *Living stones: the daughter churches of Govan Parish, 1771-1919* (Glasgow: Friends of Govan Old, forthcoming 2007) and Leishman 1921, pp 70-1.
- 25 'He [Glasgow exhibitor Dr John Smith] went about with us, and shew'd us all the Colleges, with which we were really astonish'd.' Alexander Carlyle, *Anecdotes and Characters of the Times*, James Kinsley, ed., (London: OUP, 1973) p.102. See also earlier version, John Hill Burton, ed., *The Autobiography of Dr Alexander Carlyle of Inveresk, 1722 – 1805* (London & Edinburgh: T N Foulis, 1910).
- 26 'St Michael's of Inveresk, the parish-church, is of great antiquity, but uncertain date. It is most likely that it was built soon after the introduction of Christianity, out of the ruins of the Roman fort. The stone it is built of appears to be the same with those discovered in the ruins of the pretorium. There are evidently many old stones, and many Roman bricks in the building. ... The body of the church is 102 feet long, and only 23 feet wide within the walls; but there are four aisles, two on each side of the church, that have been built at different periods and double rows of galleries in the ends of the church. The whole is now in a ruinous condition, and is truly a disgrace to the parish. Several attempts have lately been made to have it rebuilt ...' OSA, 16, 1795, pp 23-4.
- 27 *St Michael and Inveresk*, James Wilkie, ed., (Edinburgh & London: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1894), p.89.
- 28 Thomas Leishman, 'The Ritual of the Church', in Robert H. Story, ed., *The Church of Scotland Past and Present* (London, 1890), V, 307-426, pp 415-6.
- 29 For a brief synopsis of changes in worship between 1858-1865 see Tom Davidson Kelly, 'Common Order (1994): Pioneering spirit or reflective mode?', Bryan D. Spinks & Iain R. Torrance, eds, *To Glorify God, Essays on Modern Reformed Liturgy* (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1999), pp 56 -9.
- 30 R. Stuart Loudon, 'Centenary Reflections', *Annual*, 35, 1965, p.3.
- 31 'The most striking, perhaps, of our late ecclesiastical changes, is the introduction of stained-glass windows. Before the rebuilding of the Greyfriars Church – so lately as the year 1856-7 – none of our churches since the Reformation had been decorated in this way.' Lee 1864, pp 31-2; quoted Davidson Kelly 1999, p.57. Stained glass had been installed in Scottish Episcopal churches from the second decade of the nineteenth century. See Michael Donnelly *Scotland's Stained Glass, making the colours sing* (Edinburgh: The Stationery Office, 1997), p.17. It seems perverse to argue that, while it may be short lived, there is no Scottish tradition in stained glass: 'Scotland has no glass painting tradition.' Sally J Rush, 'Ungrateful posterity?', Richard Fawcett, ed., *Glasgow's Great Glass Experiment* (Edinburgh: Historic Scotland, 2003), p.64.
- 32 Lee 1864, pp 32-3. T.S. Muir had suggested in the 1840s that fine architecture, stained glass windows and good music were not the preserve of the Anglican tradition, and not inconsistent with a Presbyterian and Calvinist orthodoxy. Muir 1843, pp 7 and 97-113.
- 33 Widest of the mark: 'Late 19th-century Presbyterianism saw the first steps towards reunification, and the rise of the 'renaissance of worship' movement, advocating Episcopal-style elements of ceremony.' Miles Glendinning and Aonghus MacKechnie, *Scottish Architecture*, (London: Thames & Hudson, 2004), p.173.

34 John Sanders, 'Ecclesiology in Scotland', in Christopher Webster and John Elliott, eds, *'A Church as it Should be', The Cambridge Camden Society and its influence* (Donnington: Shaun Tyas, 2000). Sanders sees Scottish ecclesiology as a development of the Cambridge movement, rather than a parallel movement, indirectly influenced by it. 'Avowedly modelled upon the Cambridge Ecclesiological Society, its beginnings in Aberdeen were modest, but Mr. Cooper – as he then was – gradually attracted to the membership earnest men, old and young, of all classes, and from every branch of the Christian Church in Scotland. ... in one respect – its inclusion of men, and more recently of women, belonging to *all* the churches – our society advanced beyond its model.' Dr William Kelly, 'A man greatly beloved', *TSES*, Vol 7, Part 2, 1922-3 (1923), p.12.

35 Boyd 1869, p.5.

36 George W. Sprott, *The Worship, Rites, and Ceremonies of the Church of Scotland* (Edinburgh & London: William Blackwood, 1863), p.48. Dr Robert Lee discussed the causes of secessions to the Episcopal Church, *The Reform of the Church of Scotland, ... Part 1 – Worship* (Edinburgh: Edmonston & Douglas, 1864), pp 47-68.

37 Was this the pamphlet referred to at a meeting of the English Ecclesiological Society in 1863? 'He [the President] mentioned that he held in his hand a pamphlet which urged the revival of Basilicanism for the worship and ceremonies of the Established Kirk of Scotland, which seemed to him to be an argument for rejecting the arrangement. "What is right with them", he said, "should be warning to us"! Quoted W. Napier Bell 1931, p.22.

38 Sprott 1863, p.10.

39 Sprott 1863, p.53. He concedes: 'In some few things she might approximate to Episcopal usages, but it should only be on the very few points where they may be closer to the primitive and the Reformed Church than her present practice. Anything more would be inexpedient and sinful.' These ideas were highlighted by former President Dr Alastair K. Robertson in his article on Dr Sprott, *Annual*, 36, 1966, p.11. Dr Robert H. Fisher, *The Outside of the Inside, Reminiscences ...* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1919), pp 281-97, was concerned to resist imitation of Anglicanism, retaining Scottish usages and ethos, while embracing an appropriate lectionary and observance of the Christian Year.

40 George W. Sprott, *The Church Principles of the Reformation* (Edinburgh & London: William Blackwood, 1877), p.6.

41 Sprott 1877, p.16.

42 George W. Sprott *The Worship and Offices of the Church of Scotland* (Edinburgh & London: William Blackwood, 1882), pp 231-2.

43 Sprott 1882, pp 234-5.

44 *King's College Chapel, Aberdeen, 1500-2000*, Jane Geddes, ed., (Aberdeen: Northern Universities Press, 2000) pp 161 and 186.

45 Aberdeen engraver Andrew Gibb sent a copy of Campbell's article with a covering letter dated 10 Jan 1868 to John Stuart, Secretary of the Society of Antiquaries. Murray Collection, Special Collections, University of Glasgow, Mu5-e11.7. Donation by Andrew Gibb of 'Heraldic Ceiling of the Cathedral Church of [St Machar.] Aberdeen', *Proceedings of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland*, 7, p.398.

46 Gibb's letter clarifies that Campbell's text describes the colours on the heraldic shields prior to 'restoration', while the coloured plates are of the colours 'now restored' on the authority of the Lyon King of Arms.

47 Sam McKinsty, *Rowand Anderson, 'The Premier Architect of Scotland'* (Edinburgh: EUP, 1991), pp 52-8.

48 'Many old Churches have been restored, some, such as St Vigeans and that of Biggar, most successfully,' Sprott 1882, p.233. Cooper noted this restoration in 'Ecclesiology in Scotland', read to the St Paul's Ecclesiological Society 1893, *Transactions of the Aberdeen Ecclesiological Society*, Vol 2, Part 8 (1895), p.47. See *TSES*, Vol 2, Part 3, 1908-9 (1909), p.341, quoted Sanders 2000, p.315 and 'Dr Duke was probably the very first in the Church of Scotland to save an ancient parish church from being pulled down, and to have it most carefully and happily restored and properly furnished.' *TSES*, Vol 3, Part 3, 1911-2 (1912), p.xxiv.

49 'He was its founder and "only begetter"; he was the soul of it through many years in Aberdeen and Glasgow and Edinburgh; he knew the members of it, as no one else did, and the subjects of its researches and

- discussions in the wider view than any other', 'a man greatly beloved', *TSES*, Vol 7, Part 2, 1922-3 (1923), p.5, quoted Robertson 1956, p.237. 'He was the founder, and the life, of the Aberdeen Ecclesiological Society, whose influence, along with that of its younger sisters in Glasgow and Edinburgh, may be said to have wrought a revolution in the designing and arrangement of churches. Dr Cooper was learned in architecture, and loved beauty there as everywhere.' James M. Kirkpatrick, 'James Cooper, 1846-1922', *The Annual*, 17, 1947, pp 3-11. See *TSES*, Vol 3, Part 3, 1911-2 (1912), pp xix-xx, quoted Sanders 2000, p.306.
- 50 See appendix 1. i for detailed list. Principal Sir George Adam Smith identified two groups recruited by Cooper: 'ministers of his own and other churches' and 'young architects' and artists. 'A Retrospect', *TSES*, Vol 9, Part 2, 1928-9 (1929), pp 68-9.
- 51 See appendix 1. ii for detailed list.
- 52 See appendix 1. iii for detailed list.
- 53 Robertson 1956, p.258. A.C. Cheyne acknowledged his debt to this thesis in *The Transforming of the Kirk, Victorian Scotland's Religious Revolution* (Edinburgh: St Andrews Press, 1983), pp 107-9.
- 54 *TSES* Vol 4, Part 1, 1912-3 (1913), pp 3-20.
- 55 The first two numbers were titled *Liturgical Studies*, (hereafter *Lit. Stud.*).
- 56 *Annual*, 1, 1928-9, pp 56-66; John R. Hume, *Scotland's Best Churches* (Edinburgh: EUR, 2005), no 7.
- 57 *Annual*, 1, 1928-9, pp 78-84; Hume 2005, no 2.
- 58 *Annual*, 1, 1928-9, pp 87-91, 38-44, 85-6 and 94.
- 59 *Annual*, 2, 1929-30, pp 3-10; Hume 2005, no 22.
- 60 *Annual*, 2, 1929-30, pp 55-9.
- 61 *Annual*, 12, 1941-2, pp 13-6; Hume 2005, no 21.
- 62 *Annual*, 13, 1942-3, pp 17-8.
- 63 *Annual*, 14, 1943-4, pp 11-2.
- 64 *Annual*, 15, 1944-5, pp 9-11.
- 65 *Annual*, 14, 1943-4, pp 1-7.
- 66 *Annual*, 15, 1944-5, pp 1-8.
- 67 *Annual*, 13, 1942-3, pp 14-6.
- 68 For example: Alexander Smart, 'The Place for the Church Organ', *Annual*, 16, 1946, pp 23-6; J. Arnott Hamilton, 'The Stole and the Scarf', *Annual*, 16, 1946, pp 27-37; 'The Dress of Women Ministers', *Lit. Rev.*, 4.2, Nov. 1974, pp 50-4.
- 69 *Lit. Stud.*, 1.1, May 1971, pp i and ii.
- 70 *Lit. Stud.*, 1.1, May 1971, pp 42-7; Hume 2005, no 31.
- 71 *Lit. Stud.*, 1.1, May 1971, pp 48-55 and additional note, *Lit. Rev.*, 2.1, May 1972, pp 42-4.
- 72 *Lit. Stud.*, 1.1, May 1971, pp 56-63.
- 73 *Lit. Rev.*, 2.2, Nov. 1972, pp 8-15; Hume 2005, no 126 (Barclay) and no 128 (Innerleithen).
- 74 *Record*, 25, 1991, pp 33-8.
- 75 *The Record*, 29, 1995. *Record* was retitled *The Record* from volume 28, 1995.
- 76 *The Record*, 34, 1998, pp 1-43.
- 77 *The Record*, 34, 1998, pp 44-51 and *The Record*, 35, 1999, p.24.
- 78 *Annual*, 6, 1933-4, p.65; Hume 2005, no 23.
- 79 *Annual*, 8, 1935-6, pp 59-61.
- 80 *Annual*, 20, 1950, pp 59-61.
- 81 *Annual*, 24, 1954, pp 47-8.
- 82 *Annual*, 27, 1957, pp 47-9, 45 and 49 'Dr Eeles was largely inspired by the late Professor James Cooper and was himself an Aberdonian.'
- 83 *The Record*, 40, 2004, p.25.
- 84 *The Record*, 40, 2004, pp 30-6.
- 85 *Annual*, 4, 1931-2, pp 4-7; Ninian Hill also published an account in *TSES*, XI, 1933-6 (Part 1, 1933-4), pp 43-7.
- 86 *Annual*, 3, 1930-1, pp 42-7.
- 87 *Annual*, 7, 1934-5, pp 11-6.
- 88 *Annual*, 34, 1964, p.29.
- 89 *Annual*, 6, 1933-4, pp 3-4; Hume 2005, no 168.

- 90 *Annual*, 31, 1961, pp 22-9. Both 1925 hall and 1932 church were dedicated by Dr John White.
- 91 *Annual*, 25, 1955, pp 28-33. '... churches built in vernacular revival manner mode have been generally neglected by architectural commentators. Colinton Mains, built in 1954, is one such church.' Hume 2005, no 175.
- 92 *Annual*, 26, 1956, pp 25-8. The decoration of the eastern end by two mosaics and 'a marble Holy Table bearing on the front a carved representation of Leonardo da Vinci's well-known "Last Supper" was noted and illustrated', *Annual*, 1, 1928-29, pp 94 and 57.
- 93 *Annual*, 38, 1968, pp 14-16. 'The building has the appearance of a bold experiment. It immediately makes one think of the other St Columba's erected in 1592 at Burntisland. Mr Ian Lindsay has written of the Burntisland church: "the experiment was not repeated in quite that form, for in general new churches were to carry on the pre-Reformation tradition, so far as the structure was concerned, and were gradually to develop from that."' Dr John W. Fraser, 'On Behalf of the Chancel', *Annual*, 32, 1962, pp 32-4, quoting Ian G. Lindsay, *The Scottish Parish Kirk* (Edinburgh: St Andrew Press, 1960), p.41. It is perplexing that recent literature applauds that one-off design as representative of the increasingly pervasive and anachronistic idea that there is a specific 'Reformed church planning'. For example: '... the end of the sixteenth century saw a small number of churches built according to Reformed planning. Most notable is the church at Burntisland, Fife.' Neil Cameron, 'Worship and Commemoration', *Scottish Life and Society*, Vol 3, *Scotland's Buildings* (East Linton: Tuckwell, 2003), p.285.
- 94 *Lit. Stud.*, 1.2, Nov. 1971, plates 2-4. 'Few churches evoke the innovative, experimental spirit of the 1960s better than Craigsbank,' Hume 2005, no 182.
- 95 George Paterson, 'New Church Building', *Lit. Rev.*, 6.1, May 1976, pp 45-7; Hume 2005, no 180 (St Mungo's, Cumbernauld).
- 96 *Annual*, 1, 1928-9, pp 56-66; Hume 2005, no 7.
- 97 *Annual*, 1, 1928-9, pp 78-84 and *Annual* 8, 1935-6, pp 11-6; Hume 2005, no 2. It is curious that the involvement of Peter Macgregor Chalmers is not noticed by either article; perhaps a case of Pharaoh not knowing Joseph. Macgregor Chalmers had worked there at the request of fellow ecclesiologist Dr Peter Dunn.
- 98 *Annual*, 2, 1929-30, pp 55-9.
- 99 *Annual*, 2, 1929-30, pp 3-10.
- 100 *Annual*, 3, 1930-31, pp 3-8, p. 6; Hume 2005, no 26.
- 101 *Annual*, 21, 1951, pp 23-28; Hume 2005, no 6.
- 102 *Annual*, 16, 1946, pp 15-22.
- 103 *Annual*, 23, 1953, pp 18-21.
- 104 *Annual*, 17, 1947, pp 16-21, p.20. David S. Rutherford, *Biggar St Mary's, A Medieval College Kirk* (Biggar: Wilson, 1946), pp 80-1.
- 105 *Annual*, 22, 1952, pp 19-23. The 1930s restoration had been noticed in *Annual* 10, 1937-8, pp 5-11; Hume 2005, no 37.
- 106 *Annual*, 28, 1958, pp 24-30.
- 107 *Annual*, 39, 1969, pp 14-17.
- 108 *Annual*, 39, 1969, pp 24-6.
- 109 *Annual*, 38, 1968, pp 27-32; Hume 2005, no 9.
- 110 *Annual*, 8, 1935-6, pp 28-36.
- 111 *Annual*, 11, 1938-39, pp 12-16; Hume 2005, no 30.
- 112 *Annual*, 9, 1936-7, pp 17-23; Hume 2005, no 4.
- 113 *Annual*, 9, 1936-7, pp 93-4.
- 114 *Annual*, 32, 1962, pp 25-31.
- 115 *Annual*, 18, 1948, pp 17-23.
- 116 *Annual*, 23, 1953, pp 21-5.
- 117 *Annual*, 5, 1932-33, p.3.
- 118 *Annual*, 19, 1949, pp 20-4; Hume 2005, no 160.
- 119 *Annual*, 20, 1950, pp 25-31.
- 120 *Annual*, 24, 1954, pp 19-27. Following the 1908 fire, built by J.M. Dick Peddie for Robert James

Thompson, opened 1911 by Moderator of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, Dr Pearson McAdam Muir, Secretary 1887-1907, Convener of Editorial Committee 1907-15.

121 *Annual*, 27, 1957, pp 26-36.

122 *Annual*, 29, 1959, pp 24-31.

123 *Annual*, 30, 1960, pp 18-26; Hume 2005, no 11.

124 *Annual*, 36, 1966, pp 23-9; Hume 2005, no 47.

125 *Annual*, 37, 1967, pp 22-7.

126 *Annual*, 40, 1970, pp 30-40; Hume 2005, no 1.

127 *Lit. Rev.*, 3.1, May 1973, pp 47-51; Hume 2005, no 29.

128 *Lit. Rev.*, 4.1, May 1974, A.B. Gordon, 'Double and Triple – Aberdeen's Singular Churches', pp 16-21; Hume 2005 no 55 (St Nicholas Parish Church).

129 *Lit. Rev.*, 4.1, May 1974, pp 16-21.

130 *Lit. Rev.*, 5.1, May 1975, pp 63-8. The article notes that the triple sedilia (choir seats for the clergy), the piscina (for cleansing during worship) and one of Scotland's 35 surviving sacrament houses (made between the 1440s and the Reformation and used for reserving consecrated Communion elements of bread and wine) are all headed by an ogee arch.

131 see appendix 2 for detailed list.

132 TSES, Vol 11, Part 2, 1934-5 (1935), pp 72-3. Bill Smith, *D.Y. Cameron, The Visions of the Hills* (Edinburgh: Atelier Books, 1992) in an otherwise excellent study of D.Y. Cameron does not use the evidence of the *Transactions of the Scottish Ecclesiological Society* to locate Cameron in the wider ecclesiastical context of his generation.

133 *Annual*, 12, 1941-2, pp 1-4.

134 *Annual*, 2, 1929-30, pp 55-9. The extent of D.Y. Cameron's artistic involvement is detailed in R.W.A. Begg, *The Renovation of Kippen Parish Church, 1924-1961* (Stirling: Learmonth, 1962).

135 *Annual*, 5, 1932-3, p.3.

136 John and William Anderson, *St Leonard's Parish Church 1904 to 1987* (Dunfermline: Kirk Session of St Leonard's, 1987), p.11; 'In Memoriam', *Annual*, 20, 1950, pp 54-5.

137 Dr A. Ian Dunlop discussed the fate of Edinburgh church buildings, redundant between 1929-1975, listing those demolished and those used by other denominations or for a range of non-ecclesiastical purposes. *Lit. Rev.*, 7. 1, May 1977, pp 20-4.

138 Davidson Kelly, forthcoming 2007. Also noted by James Whyte in his 'Response to the Centenary Lecture' in *The Record* 34, 1998, p.48.

139 'The case of Oatlands is, however, singular in many ways, for it has the distinction of being organised (and that on right lines) in a way which I wish with all my heart was exemplified in all the other *quoad sacra* Parishes within the bounds of the old civil Parish of Govan.' Govan Parish Magazine, November 1895, quoted Kirkpatrick 1915, p.14.

140 Charles G. Inglis in *Lit. Stud.*, 1.2, Nov. 1971, pp 45-8.

141 For example: St Ninian's Church, Aberdeen; Cowan Memorial Chapel, West St Nicholas; various war memorials and tablets. 'Of Dr Kelly's Gothic buildings, he himself regarded St Ninian's Church as his best. In its external elevations it is thoroughly Scottish, and has about it a certain quality of crystalline clarity and austere restraint that is in full keeping with the Aberdeen granite. Close and discriminating study of medieval models is revealed in the beautiful entasis of the tower. The wide arched recess in which is set the door gives dignity and interest to the front. A like severity marks the interior, in which the plain drums and simple chamfered arches of pink Corrennie granite, and the lofty embowed timber roof, are in the best tradition of the fifteenth century.

St Ninian's Church ...reveals very clearly Dr Kelly's conception of Scottish church architecture. Needless to say, he rejected absolutely the bad old idea, so hard of dying, that ugliness is a necessary or inevitable concomitant of a Presbyterian church, or that a church should be regarded as a preaching-box, not a place of worship. ... There was no reason, he would insist, why a Presbyterian Church should not be as beautiful as a Roman Catholic or an Anglican one; only its beauty must be simple and restrained, in keeping with the austere worship for which it is designed.' Douglas Simpson, *William Kelly* (Aberdeen: The University Press, 1949), p.5.

- 142 For example, Greyfriars Church, Aberdeen, and Lowson Memorial Church, Forfar; Hume 2005, nos 153 and 163.
- 143 See Tom Davidson Kelly, 'Peter Macgregor Chalmers (1859-1922), Presbyterian and Catholic Designer' (forthcoming).
- 144 The different proportions of the 1950 communion table and stone elders' seats alter the balance of his design.
- 145 Fisher 1919, p.284. See also Leishman 1890, pp 420-1 and 423.
- 146 *Annual*, 16, 1946, pp 3-5. See also Richard Fawcett, *Scottish Medieval Churches, architecture & furnishings* (Stroud: Tempus, 2002), pp 279-80.
- 147 *Annual* 16, 1946, pp 3-14, p.12.
- 148 'In 1967, a Celtic cross and set of candlesticks were placed in the window ledge of the chancel and a lectern was placed on the other side of the chancel arch from the pulpit. These were all wrought in ironwork and are the gift of Mr. Archibald Cobban, blacksmith, an Elder in the parish, who designed and made them. They are an exquisite example of village craftsmanship.' *Lit. Rev.*, 2.1, May 1972, pp 34-41, p.40.
- 149 *Annual*, 2, 1929-30, pp 55-9 and R.W.A. Begg, *The Renovation of Kippen Parish Church, 1924-1961* (Stirling: Learmonth, 1962).
- 150 *Annual*, 12, 1941-2, pp 1-4, pp 1, 3.
- 151 *Glasgow's great glass experiment*, Richard Fawcett, ed., (Edinburgh: Historic Scotland, 2003). Windows by British artists would be installed in the lower church: Ballantine & Allan, Clayton & Bell, Henry Hughes, O'Connor of London and W. Wailes. Iain D. Macnair, *Glasgow Cathedral, stained glass windows, millennium edition* (Glasgow, 2001), pp 25-7.
- 152 *Annual*, 35, 1965, pp 28-38 and 35-6. In the event, a sample of Munich glass was left *in situ* in the north-east and south-east transept clerestory windows, and in the rose window above the entrance door in the nave south wall. Macnair 2001, p. 2.
- 153 See Davidson Kelly, forthcoming 2007.
- 154 'In the beautiful War Memorial Chapel in S. Cuthbert's, Edinburgh, the late Dr Macgregor Chalmers used marble panelling with telling effect. One can readily see how a building, small in size and simple in plan, can be made exquisitely lovely by the fine treatment of its walls.' J. Arnott Hamilton, 'The Development of Ecclesiastical Art in Scotland', *Annual*, 3, 1930-1, pp 34-41, p.39.
- 155 *Annual*, 40, 1970, pp 30-40.
- 156 Roger S. Kirkpatrick 1930; Hume 2005, no 20.
- 157 *Annual* 1, 1928-9, pp 55-66; Howell 1929, pp 43-52; *TSES*, Vol 11, Part 3, 1935-6 (1936), pp 145-57.
- 158 Tom Davidson Kelly in *The Record*, 40, 2004, pp 30-36.
- 159 *Annual*, 35, 1965, p.16.
- 160 *Annual*, 35, 1965, p.16. Compare the view of elder Sir D.Y. Cameron on the level of artistic ignorance among Scottish clergy and the need for education during their training.
- 161 *Common Order* (Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 1994, 1996 and 2005).